Faculty Senate Minutes #251

John Jay College of Criminal Justice

October 22, 2003  3:15 PM  Room 630 T


Absent (17): Desmond Arias, Luis Barrios, Orlanda Brugnola, Peter DeForest, Janice Dunham, Michele Galietta, Konstantinos Georgatos, Betsy Gitter, Amy Green, Judith Hawkins, Max Kadir, Kwando Kinshasa, Evan Mandery, Lorraine Moller, Sung Ha Suh, Davidson Umeh, Thalia Vrachopolous

1. Announcements from the chair
2. Approval of Minutes #250 of the October 9, 2003, meeting
3. Proposal to disseminate documents about the election of the 3 faculty to the Search Committee
4. Declaration of two vacancies on the Faculty Senate
5. Determination of a method to fill the two vacant Senate seats
6. Election to fill the two vacant Senate seats
7. Election to fill a vacant faculty seat on the College Council
8. Proposal that the Senate create a link to its homepage for presidential search documents
9. Report on the status of the Westport facility & the CUNY Board of Trustees October 20 hearing
10. Report on a plan required by CUNY as a condition of the Westport rental
11. Proposal that the Senate recommend that a JJ Space Committee, with faculty, be established
12. Discussion about the unannounced October 22 fire drill in North Hall
13. Election of Senate Committee members and Committee Chairs
14. Election of 5 Senators to the College Comprehensive Planning Committee
15. Report on the October 16 meeting of the College Council

1. Announcements from the chair

President Kaplowitz thanked the many Senators and others who were at the Senate’s meeting about the proposed Policy on Workplace Privacy who subsequently communicated their views by email to the Taskforce, the process that had been agreed to at that Senate meeting by both the Taskforce members present and by the Senate.
Senator John Matteson asked whether there has been any response from the Taskforce about how it plans to proceed. Upon learning there has not been, Senator Matteson, who is a lawyer, offered to research and draft an alternate policy for consideration by the Senate if the Senate wishes him to do so. He said he thinks it is extremely important that the College have a policy protecting our privacy and that it is important that such a policy be in place this year, before the new College President takes office.

President Kaplowitz thanked Senator Matteson for his generous offer and suggested she first speak with Dean Levine, the Chair of the Taskforce, to ascertain the situation; she said she wouldn’t want Senator Matteson to take on such a task if it turns out to be unnecessary, if it turns out the Taskforce is working on resolving the important issues that have been raised. Senator Matteson and the Senate agreed to this approach and all expressed appreciation to Senator Matteson for his offer.

At the September meeting of the College Council, Council members cast ballots for several elections and the College’s Faculty Elections Committee counted the ballots and certified the elections. The six faculty elected to the Executive Committee of the College Council are Professors Marvie Brooks, Kirk Dombrowski, Joshua Freilich, Lorraine Moller, Lillian Soto-Fernandez, and Davidson Umeh; the HEO representative is Sandra Palleja. The College Council Executive Committee members also include two students, not yet identified, and four statutory members: the College President, Provost, VP for Student Development, and VP for Administration.

The two students elected to the College P&B Committee are Shauna-Kay Gooden and Andrei Lindsay. The six faculty elected to the 2003-4 Student Activities Association’s Board of Directors are: Professors Kojo Dei, Katherine Killoran, Kwando Kinshasa, Susan Larkin, Carmen Solis, and Carl Williams.

2. Approval of Minutes #250 of the October 9, 2003, meeting

By a motion made and adopted, Minutes #250 of the October 9 meeting were approved.

3. Motion to disseminate to the faculty relevant documents about the election of the 3 faculty to the Presidential Search Committee

The previous day, the Council of Chairs voted unanimously to transmit to all faculty a packet of documents relevant to the election of the 3 faculty to the Presidential Search Committee. The Council of Chairs made this decision because, despite the October 6 written ruling by the Vice Chancellor for Legal Affairs Frederick P. Schaffer that the election complied with all CUNY Bylaws and Search Guidelines and was properly conducted, Professor Malone, who had written a letter on September 30 challenging the election process and election results, to which the Vice Chancellor’s ruling was the response, has nevertheless subsequently written to the faculty, on October 14, again and wrongly alleging that the election was not legitimate.

Because the packet of relevant documents, which had been sent to Vice Chancellor Schaffer by Faculty Senate President Kaplowitz on October 1 in response to Professor Malone’s letter, had
been distributed to only the Council of Chairs and the Faculty Senate, because the two groups comprised the electorate, the Council of Chairs voted the previous day to send the packet of documents to the entire faculty, so that the faculty could be provided with accurate information, which the Council of Chairs determined was the appropriate response to Professor Malone’s latest letter of October 14.

The Chairs also voted at its meeting yesterday to request that the Faculty Senate join with the Council of Chairs in issuing the packet of documents to all faculty.

A motion was made and seconded to accept the invitation of the Chairs to jointly send the packet of documents to all faculty. The motion was adopted by unanimous vote.

The documents in this packet are Professor Malone’s September 30 letter to 80th Street; Professor Kaplowitz’s October 1 letter of response to 80th Street on behalf of the Senate; Vice Chancellor Schaffer’s October 6 written ruling; the document from the Executive Committee to the Senate prior to the September 3, 2003, meeting comprising a series of possible options for the Senate to consider for each of the decisions it would have to make on September 3 about the nomination and elections procedures; the Minutes of the Senate’s September 3 meeting; the Minutes of the Senate’s September 11 meeting; a copy of the ballot; a copy of the envelope addressed to Professor Valerie Allen, Chair, Faculty Elections Committee, for casting the secret ballots; the September 23 letter from Professor Allen reporting the names of the faculty elected; the tally of votes: although the tally sheet sent to VC Schaffer included the number of votes cast for all eight candidates, as issued by the Faculty Elections Committee, the Executive Committees of the Chairs and Senate decided that the tally sheet in the packet to the faculty would contain the names and number of votes received by the three elected but that the names of the other five would be deleted; however, the numbers of votes cast for the other five would remain on the tally sheet without identification as to which candidate received which number of votes; and a copy of the Faculty Senate Constitution.

[Copies of the letter from Professor Malone dated September 30, 2003; of the letter on behalf of the Faculty Senate from Professor Kaplowitz dated October 1, 2003; and of the letter providing the legal ruling from Vice Chancellor for Legal Affairs and Legal Counsel to the Board of Trustees Frederick P. Schaffer dated October 6, 2003, are available as attachments to Faculty Senate Minutes #250 of October 9, 2003: they are Attachments A, B, and C.]

4. **Declaration of two vacant seats on the Faculty Senate**

Because one at-large representative of the faculty, Senator Dagoberto Orrantia, has had to resign his seat, with expressed regret for a personal and private reason, and because one at-large representative of the adjunct faculty, Senator Marielu Galvan, is not teaching at John Jay this semester, both seats were declared vacant by a motion made and adopted.

5. **Determination of a method to fill the two vacant Faculty Senate seats**

The Senate voted to elect those individuals on the ballot who received the next highest
number of votes in the April elections for the full-time at-large and adjunct at-large 2003-4 Faculty Senate representatives. This decision was made without the knowledge of who those individuals are.

6. **Election to fill the two vacant Faculty Senate seats**

   In implementing the decision of the Senate to elect the next highest vote recipients in the April elections, Professor Heath Grant (Law, Police Science, Criminal Justice Administration) was elected as an at-large representative of the full-time faculty and Professor Chris Knight (English) was elected as an at-large representative of the adjunct faculty. The two were telephoned and invited to the meeting and the two assumed their seats on the Senate to the welcoming applause of the Senate.

7. **Election to fill a vacant faculty seat on the College Council**

   Because Professor Marilu Galvan had been elected by the Senate in April to one of the eight College Council seats which the Faculty Senate may fill and because she is not teaching this year and, therefore, is not eligible to serve on the Senate or on the College Council, a vacancy has been created on the College Council. A motion to table this item was approved.

8. **Proposal that the Senate provide a link to its homepage for documents related to the presidential search process**

   Professor Ned Benton has offered to establish a link to the Faculty Senate’s homepage which would be a repository of documents relevant to the search for president of John Jay. A motion to authorize Professor Benton to do so and to thank him was approved by unanimous vote.

9. **Report on the Westport rental facility & the CUNY Board of Trustees October 20 hearing [Attachment A1 & A2]**

   The CUNY Board of Trustees has on its October 27 agenda a proposal to rent two floors of the Westport building, on 56th Street and 10th Avenue, for John Jay. The Faculty Senate had adopted a Resolution at its September 25 meeting [Attachment A-2] calling upon the CUNY Central Administration to take this action and sent the Resolution to Chancellor Matthew Goldstein, Senior Vice Chancellor & COO Allan Dobrin, Vice Chancellor Emesto Malave, and Vice Chancellor Emma Macari [Attachment A-1].

   Also, as they had promised to do at the Senate’s September 25 meeting, Professors Ned Benton and Karen Kaplowitz privately reported to various members of the Chancellery the conscious raising activities and protest actions planned by John Jay faculty if the Resolution were to prove insufficient to convince 80th Street to rent and pay most if not all the rental of the Westport facility.
President Kaplowitz noted that when she and Professor Benton privately reported Senator Peter DeForest’s plan to offer to collect DNA samples from all John Jay students, faculty, and staff so that bodies of victims could be identified in case of a fire in North Hall the reaction was particularly dramatic, especially when it was explained that Senator DeForest is one of the foremost forensic scientists in the world and that his plan has been proposed because the lack of DNA samples is what has made the identification of the victims of the 9/11 tragedy so slow, difficult, and incomplete.

The John Jay administration has also made the case to 80th Street, although they also offered to pay half the annual rental costs from our meager operating budget, whereas the Senate’s position was that the CUNY Central Administration should pay most if not all the rental costs.

These various efforts and activities have been successful. The Board of Trustees’ Committee on Facilities approved a resolution on October 8 to rent space at Westport for John Jay. However, the Board’s resolution, which is on its October 27 agenda, which was just released, is vague about the amount of Westport space that will be rented. The Board Resolution states:

Resolved, That the Board of Trustees of The City University of New York authorize the University to execute a new lease agreement, on behalf of John Jay College of Criminal Justice, to rent a minimum of 46,000 square feet of space and a maximum of approximately 59,000 square feet at the premises known as 845 Tenth Avenue, New York. The agreement shall be subject to approval as to form by the University Office of General Counsel.

The “Explanation” following the text of the Board resolution concludes with the statement:

The terms of the lease are being negotiated and will be finalized by the October [27] Board Meeting at which time a revised resolution with actual numbers will be presented for Board approval [emphasis added].

Because the College needs all 59,000 square feet, which comprises all of the first two floors of Westport, that is, the entirety of the commercial space in this new residential building, and because 46,000 square feet, which the Board might decide upon, is insufficient, and because there was reason to believe that the Chancellery and the Board were planning to rent only 46,000 square feet (a floor and a half) rather than the full two floors (59,000 square feet), a group of faculty decided to testify at the October 20 public hearing of the Board of Trustees about this agenda item. Ten faculty signed up to testify at the public hearing: Professors Ned Benton, Glenn Corbett, Edward Davenport, Karen Kaplowitz, Tom Litwack, Jerry Markowitz, Maureen O’Connor, Steven Penrod, Timothy Stevens, and Harold Sullivan.

In both written and oral testimony, the faculty made the case that all 59,000 square feet are desperately needed. Their testimony included data about the amount of net assignable square feet (NASF) per each FTE (full-time equivalent) student at John Jay compared to the other colleges: the NASF is the amount of space that can actually be used for classrooms, offices, and other college facilities; it does not include outdoor space (and so our lack of a campus is not a factor) and it does not include spaced for elevator shafts, boiler rooms, HVAC systems, etc.; rather, NASF is space available for college activities, such as classrooms, offices, lounges, lecture halls, cafeterias, etc.
John Jay now has 46 NASF per FTE student. In Fall 2001, the most recent semester for which these data are available, Medgar Evers, the next most space deprived senior college, had 66 NASF/FTE student; Baruch had 73, NYCCT 81, Hunter 93, Staten Island 96, Graduate Center 130, Queens 137, York 141, Brooklyn 148, CUNY Law 207. City College, at the other end of the spectrum from John Jay, had 226 NASF per FTE student. Again, NASF does not include outside space; it does not include campus grounds.

The CUNY senior college average that semester was 110 NASF and the senior college average without John Jay was 149 NASF. For John Jay to achieve the average of 149 NASF, we would have to enroll only 3,093 FTE students, instead of the more than 10,000 FTEs that we currently enroll; that is, we’d have to reduce our enrollment by 70 percent. Even the average NASF at the community colleges, 81, is almost double that of John Jay’s. Indeed, the NASF at all the community colleges exceeds that of John Jay.

And even when Phase II is constructed in five years, if we were to be at the enrollment we were at last year, 9,500 FTEs we will have only 67 NASF. When Medgar Evers’ new facility is open, assuming current enrollment, Medgar Evers will have 90 NASF per FTE, leaving John Jay still the most space poor college with severe space shortages which means our College’s facilities will still be inadequate to meet the teaching and research needs of our students and faculty. Phase III, which is to provide the rest of the space we need, is not even in the 5-year Capital Plan CUNY has just submitted to Albany; indeed, it is now even yet in the queue of capital projects for CUNY.

The plan for the Westport facility was explained by the faculty in both oral and written testimony: because 18 classrooms in North Hall are being eliminated to reduce the density of people for safety and egress reasons, 18 classrooms will be built in Westport simply to replace those 18 classrooms being eliminated, and so we won’t even be gaining any classrooms; B&N bookstore will move to Westport and will be accessible from the street for both John Jay and community patrons; offices will be built there as well as a dining facility and lounges.

Because North Hall does not have a sprinkler system, safe areas that must have 2-hour fire-rated walls have to be constructed wherever 75 or more people are capable of congregating and nothing may be placed in those safe areas which must not be used, except in the case of an emergency, in which case those people in the facilities that hold 75 people or more are to enter and wait in the safe area for rescue by the NYFD or other rescue units: therefore, the computer center must be reduced in size for a safe area for Room 1311 NH to be built and, therefore, part of the computer center would be moved to where the bookstore now is; a quarter of the cafeteria must also be made into a safe area and so that lost space will be replaced with a dining facility in Westport. The Learning Center and freshmen programs would move to Westport.

In this way, the Psychology Department, which is in North Hall and which has insufficient space, would be able to expand in time for the Fall, when its new Ph.D. program, which was just approved by the NYS Board of Regents, will have its first class of doctoral students: that space is needed for seminar rooms, faculty offices, and offices for doctoral students, who will be doing clinical work. All these changes to North hall can be effectuated only if all 59,000 square feet are rented.

After hearing testimony about the difference in John Jay’s NASF per FTE and that of the other senior colleges and after hearing about the mandated alterations of the North Hall facility that
are being conducted for safety reasons and the consequent immediate need for space, Chairman Benno Schmidt announced that he had been convinced and that he and the Board would support the rental of the full 59,000 square feet. He noted that it is virtually never the case that the Board announces its decision about an issue raised at a public hearing but the case that the faculty made was so compelling that he would break tradition to respond, as he had just done.

All 10 faculty provided written copies of their testimony for distribution to the full Chancellery, all of whom were present at the public hearing, as well as for distribution to the full Board.

Chancellor Matthew Goldstein then stated that the rental of the full 59,000 square feet at Westport is something which he, too, supports because of the compelling reasons presented by the faculty in their testimony but, he said, the Westport rental is conditional on certain actions by the College [See agenda item 10.]

10. Report on a plan required by CUNY as a condition of renting Westport

President Kaplowitz reported that there were a number of conditions imposed by Chancellor Goldstein and Chair Benno Schmidt with regard to the rental of the Westport facility. The College must reduce its enrollment to last year’s level, which was 9,500 FTEs; we are now at more than 10,000. And the College is to cap enrollment thereafter at 9,500 FTEs.

The College must develop and submit a plan to 80th Street which addresses enrollment management; full utilization of the registration grid in North Hall and T Building; full utilization of the registration grid in the Westport facility; and methods for facilitating the sharing of our associate degree programs with other CUNY campuses. President Kaplowitz said that her response to Chancellor Goldstein at the public hearing when he announced these conditions was to pledge, on behalf of the faculty, that the faculty would work with the College administration as well as with the CUNY administration to develop and implement the mandated plan. With that agreement, the Chancellor said he will support the full rental of the Westport facility at the Board on October 27.

A motion was made and approved to authorize Karen Kaplowitz and Tom Litwack to represent the Senate, with Harold Sullivan and Ned Benton who represent the Chairs, in discussing with the College administration the ways to develop such a plan and the consultation with the faculty that is required, and the ways that such consultation will take, and to report back to the Senate.

11. Proposal that the Senate recommend that a College Space Allocation Committee, with faculty members, be established

A Space Allocation Committee existed at John Jay a number of years ago, which was chaired by John Smith, Robert Pignatello’s predecessor as VP for Administration at the time. The Committee also comprised the Chair of the Council of Chairs, the Chair of the College Budget Planning Committee, the President of the Senate, the Provost, the VP for Student Development, and several others. This Committee made recommendations about the allocation of College space.
After student enrollment grew dramatically, there was no longer any space available to be allocated, and so the then Vice President for Administration abolished the Committee. Because 18 classrooms will be eliminated in North Hall to reduce the density of people, and because those 18 classrooms will be converted into offices and lounge areas, a Space Allocation Committee is needed once again.

A motion was made and adopted that the Senate recommend that a College Space Allocation Committee, with a membership that includes faculty, be established to allocate space at John Jay and that the faculty members be elected by the Faculty Senate and the Council of Chairs.

12. Discussion about the October 22 unannounced fire drill in North Hall

The Senate discussed today’s fire drill in North Hall, which was not known about in advance by the Security officers or others: such an unannounced fire drill had been among the Senate’s suggestions to the administration because the only way to truly determine if egress will be quick and orderly and whether the systems and procedures work is to have a drill about which only one or two people know. Senator P. J. Gibson spoke about the terribly overcrowded stairwells during the evacuation drill.

Senator Tom Litwack said that today’s fire drill has radicalized him: he called it a terrifying experience to be in a stairwell in which no one moved or was able to move for about 8 minutes and added that if there had been smoke or any other evidence of actual danger, there would have been tremendous trampling and many would have sustained terrible injuries if not worse. He had been teaching and he and his students used the stairway indicated on the sign in his classroom: the stairway that exits onto 59th Street behind the B&N bookstore.

Senator Francis Sheehan reported that the fire alarm bell did not sound on the 2nd floor where he was teaching nor did the PA system transmit anything. He and his students learned about the drill only because their classroom door happened to be open (because the classroom was so overheated) and so when they heard people moving in the corridors they investigated and only then and in that way did they learn about the evacuation of the building.

Senator Sheehan noted that whereas one can report a problem online to Buildings & Grounds, and, thus, create an electronic record of a problem and of the report, no such online system exists for reporting Security issues. He moved that the Senate recommend that a system be implemented whereby reports to Security about Security issues may be made online as well as by telephone or in person (in cases of emergencies) and that this system be modeled after the Buildings & Grounds (B&G) online reporting system. The motion was adopted by unanimous vote.

13. Election of Faculty Senate Committee members and Committee Chairs

a. Fiscal Advisory Committee. The following were elected:
   Kirk Dombrowski
   Amy Green
   Karen Kaplowitz
   Tom Litwack (Chair)
b. Adjunct Issues Committee. The following were elected:
   Orlanda Brugnola  Chris Knight  Robin Whitney

c. Technology Committee. The following were elected:
   Anthony Carpi  Lou Guinta (Co-Chair),
   Robert Hong  Karen Kaplowitz
   Kathy Killoran  Richard Lovely
   Keith Markus  Bonnie Nelson (Co-Chair)
   Peter Shenkin  Maggie Smith
   Timothy Stevens

14. **Election of 5 Senators to the College Comprehensive Planning Committee**

   The Senate has five representatives on the College’s Comprehensive Planning Committee
   (CPC). Senator Litwack said that the CPC will have to be one of the entities that takes up
   the issue of enrollment management, both because of the safety problems demonstrated by
today’s fire drill, and because enrollment management is one of the conditions of our getting
the rental space at Westport. He also noted that the other aspects of the plan required by 80th
Street also need to be studied by the CPC.

   Senator Litwack pointed out that additionally, Middle States is requiring a report by April 1,
2005, in which the College must demonstrate its long range planning in a number of areas, including
facilities and budget.

   The Senate elected as its representatives to the Comprehensive Planning Committee:
   Effie Cochran  Tom Litwack
   Kirk Dombrowski  Francis Sheehan
   Karen Kaplowitz

15. **Report on the October 16 meeting of the College Council**

   At the October 16 meeting of the College Council, the Minutes of the September College
Council meeting were approved. Other than announcements, there were no other agenda items.

   By a motion made and carried, the meeting was adjourned at 4:45 pm.

   Respectfully submitted,

   Edward Davenport
   Recording Secretary
October 1, 2003

To: Chancellor Matthew Goldstein  
Senior Vice Chancellor Allan Dobrin  
Vice Chancellor Emesto Malave  
Vice Chancellor Emma Macari

From: Karen Kaplowitz  
President, Faculty Senate

Re: Funding for Critically Needed Rental Space for John Jay

Dear Colleagues,

On behalf of John Jay’s Faculty Senate, I am enclosing a Resolution unanimously adopted by the Faculty Senate at its September 25, 2003, meeting, on the funding for critically needed rental space for the College.

I look forward to being able to convey to the Faculty Senate your response to the Senate’s Resolution and I am, of course, available to provide additional information or to answer questions about the Resolution. Thank you.

cc. President Gerald W. Lynch  
Vice President Robert Pignatello  
Provost Basil Wilson  
Professor Ned Benton, Chair, JJ Budget Committee  
Professor Harold Sullivan, Chair, Council of Chairs  
Professor Jim Cohen, PSC Chapter Chair

att.
Resolution on the Funding of Critically Needed Rental Space for John Jay

September 25, 2003

Faculty Senate of John Jay College of Criminal Justice

Approved by Unanimous Vote

Whereas, CUNY explicitly acknowledges that John Jay College is and has been historically underfunded in comparison to other CUNY senior colleges, and CUNY last month initiated the implementation of an allocation model for the faculty funding portion of the base operating budgets in order to remedy this underfunding over time, and

Whereas, CUNY also acknowledges that John Jay College lacks sufficient campus space compared to other CUNY senior colleges, and CUNY has consequently supported the Phase I project as a partial remedy to this shortage, with the planned for Phase III to be the long-term remedy, and

Whereas, CUNY also recognizes, based on independent professional studies, that John Jay's North Hall, which houses the majority of the College's classrooms, faculty offices, student clubs, student services, and the children's center, has extensive violations of fire and safety codes and standards, including over-occupancy, excessive egress distances, and substandard egress capacity, and CUNY has initiated renovation projects to partially remedy these dangerous conditions, and

Whereas, The same studies recognize that John Jay has a critical need for additional space in order to align the numbers of people using North Hall with the capacity of North Hall, based on standards and codes, and

Whereas, CUNY is considering a proposal to rent two floors of the Westport facility located at 10th Avenue and 56th Street, for the purpose of providing John Jay with alternative space that is necessary in order to more closely align North Hall occupancies with the requirements of codes and standards, and

Whereas, The cost of the rental may exceed $2 million, an amount that both greatly exceeds the financial resources of John Jay College and that also greatly exceeds the funds recently allocated to the campus to begin to remedy historical budget inequities, and
September 25, 2003, Resolution

on the Funding of Critically Needed Space for John Jay

(continued)

Whereas, If John Jay were equitably funded, given current CUNY resources, John Jay’s FY2004 Base Budget would be approximately $16 million greater than its present allocation and its Grand Total Operating Budget would be approximately $13 million greater than its current allocation, and

Whereas, John Jay requires the entirety of its currently allocated resources to provide instruction and support services to our students and faculty, while maintaining fiscal responsibility,

Therefore, the Faculty Senate of John Jay College of Criminal Justice Resolves that:

The University should promptly approve the Westport facility rental and associated modifications of North Hall to enhance compliance with codes and standards and to better protect the safety of John Jay students, faculty, staff, and guests; and

The University should fund the project in a manner that does not draw at all upon John Jay’s currently allocated budget resources; and

The University should not place John Jay College in the untenable position of having to choose between either improving the safety of those who use North Hall or maintaining the current level of John Jay’s already extremely underfunded teaching resources and academic support services.