Faculty Senate Minutes #397

December 7, 2012 9:30 AM Room 630H


Absent (9): Erica Burleigh, Elise Champeil, Tim Horohoe, Cyriaco Lopes, Yu Ma, Amie Macdonald, Evan Mandery, Brian Montes, Nick Petraco

Invited Guests: CUNY Vice Chancellor for Facilities Planning, Construction and Management Iris Weinshall, CUNY Director of Space Planning Meghan Moore-Wilk, and CUNY Director of Capital Planning Anton Wolfshorndl; Professor Keith Markus

Guests: Professors Jill Grossfifer, Bonnie Nelson, Ed Snadjr

Agenda

1. Adoption of the agenda
2. Adoption of Minutes #396 of the November 19 meeting
3. Announcements
4. Reports: All-Funds Budget Report
5. Declaration of vacancies of 2 Senate/CC seats and decision as to course of action
6. Oral reports about draft Chapters 6-10 of the Middle States Self-Study Report at http://johnjay.jjay.cuny.edu/ mstates/reaccreditation.asp
7. Draft revised Student Evaluation of the Faculty instrument: Invited guest: SEOF Committee Vice Chair, Professor Keith Markus
8. Draft proposal on student and faculty access to JJ buildings for research purposes
9. Preparation for the Senate meeting with VC Weinshall about JJ's space needs
10. Invited Guest: Provost Jane Bowers
11. Review of agenda of the December 10 and December 12 meetings of the College Council
1. **Adoption of the agenda.** Approved

2. **Adoption of Minutes #396 of the November 19 meeting.** Approved.

3. **Announcements & Reports: All-Funds Budget Report.** Noted.

4. **Declaration of vacancies of 2 Senate/CC seats and decision as to course of action**

   The Senate declared the seats of Professors Veronica Hendrick and Nicholas Petraco vacant and decided to issue a call for nominations and hold the election during the February 6, 2013, meeting of the Senate.

5. **Oral reports about draft Chapters 6-10 of the Middle States Self-Study Report at http://johnjay.jjay.cuny.edu/mstates/reaccreditation.asp**

   December 15 is the last date for submitting substantive comments about the Middle States Self-Study Report. Those Senators assigned to read Chapters 6-10 reported about them orally. Senator Kwando Kinshasa moved that the Gen Ed Assessment Report be placed on the agenda of the February 6, 2013, Senate meeting; the motion was adopted by unanimous vote.

6. **Draft revised Student Evaluation of the Faculty instrument:** Invited guests: SEOF Committee members Professors Alex Long (chair), Keith Markus (vice chair), Josh Clegg, Rod Colvin. Noted.

7. **Draft proposed policy on student and faculty access to JJ buildings for research purposes.** Noted.

8. **Preparation for the meeting with VC Weinshall about JJ’s space needs.** Noted.

9. **Invited Guest: Vice Chancellor for Facilities Iris Weinshall** [Attachment A]

   CUNY Vice Chancellor for Facilities Planning, Construction and Management Iris Weinshall was warmly welcomed. She introduced her colleagues: CUNY Director of Space Planning Meghan Moore-Wilk and CUNY Director of Capital Planning Anton Wolfshorndl. [See Attachment A for a transcript of the meeting.]

Provost Bowers responded to the Faculty Senate’s and PSC’s resolutions that call for a reduction in the faculty teaching load and she also spoke about what she heard at the faculty forums about the Coache Survey results.


The meeting was adjourned at 5:00 pm.

Submitted by
The Executive Committee
Senate President Kaplowitz: I would like to introduce all of our Senators to our wonderful Vice Chancellor of Facilities, Planning, Construction and Management. Vice Chancellor Weinshall, I would like to introduce you to the Faculty Senate. Would you like to introduce your colleagues?

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: I would like to introduce two very important people at CUNY and in particular to my division. Director Meghan Moore-Wilk is a Director of Planning for Facilities and, therefore, the Director of Planning for CUNY on the capital side, and Anton Wolfshorndl, an Assistant Director and an architect, is assigned to John Jay’s campus along with the campuses of Bronx Community College, Lehman College, and Kingsborough Community College. My staff is divided by campuses. Both Anton and Meghan have been in CUNY for a very long time.

Senate President Kaplowitz: Iris came to CUNY just as we were about to break ground for our New Building. It was very fortuitous for us. Meghan had been very involved in the planning of the new building for many years prior and since and we had a wonderful architect – Skidmore, Owings and Merrill – with a vision for the building that was sometimes not consonant with our vision - and when Iris arrived, she said to SOM that John Jay is the client and so we should get to make the decisions about what we want.

In addition, because of Iris, we also got an additional $125 million which, among other things, made the Jay Walk possible. We were not going to have to the Jay Walk. It was going to be just a graveded roof top. Iris went to the State and got this additional $125 million for the Jay Walk, and for the terrazzo floors in the lobby, and for the fins that make the building shine as you go round the building, for the steel for the foundation ...

Director Wolfshorndl: And for an entire floor of science labs and also the capacity to actually add space in the future.

Senate President Kaplowitz: Oh, absolutely! Under the Jay Walk was going to be just a basic foundation, but because of what Iris was able to achieve in terms of funding, and this is amazing, we got what originally was designed, which was a foundation under Jay Walk that is sufficient - at some future point - to build another entire building. So, all of this is extraordinary and we love the Jaywalk; we love the building. So, please tell us your impressions of your job and of the new building, and of John Jay. But first let me explain why we aren’t meeting in the New Building but rather in Haaren.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: They are filming a movie there?
Senate President Kaplowitz: Yes, they are, but that’s not why. Our curriculum committee is meeting about Pathways next door in Room 610. Many of the people on the Senate have courses that are being considered there at this very time, and so that is why we are here today, so that Senators can move between the meetings. I want to explain this so you won’t misunderstand why some faculty may be coming and going. And so, please tell us whatever you want, then we’ll have questions, and presentations. And thank you for accepting our invitation.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: It is my pleasure. I again tell you. Usually the faculty does not want to talk to me. I have never before been invited by a faculty group. I feel a little left out, but it’s okay. I am honored to come here. Thank you for having me.

So, as Karen noted, I came to CUNY in 2007, having served for about 25 years in City Government. My last position was as the Transportation Commissioner for the City and I worked for two mayors. I started with Rudy Giuliani and I was re-appointed by Mike Bloomberg and then I decided by 2007 that I had enough and was looking for new challenges.

I am a CUNY graduate. I went to Brooklyn College and I like to point out that I was the last class to be accepted before open enrollment and I think benefited very well from the curriculum at Brooklyn College. I have constant debates with my daughters who both went to Ivy League schools and I tell them that I could match them course for course, and even tell them that I had a better education than they did. But of course they say no, I am wrong, but what do they know, they are young. My mother-in-law graduated from Brooklyn College as well. So, there is a real affinity with our family to Brooklyn College.

Senate President Kaplowitz: If I might say it, we feel we know your daughters. Your husband, Senator Schumer, talks about them so vividly we feel we know them.

Senate Vice President Francis Sheehan: He gives us an annual report.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: I am told the faculty wanted him to change his speech because they put up with it for years and years and years. He claims that even though the faculty has heard it, all the people in the audience had not. So, you know, I tried. I tried to get him to change it. I did not have much luck.

Anyway, I have to say, I think I have the best job in CUNY, even a better job, I think than the Chancellor. At the end of the day, what we do in our division is we create the future for CUNY and you can physically see what we create. That’s a great job, I mean, you know, you guys teach young adults, some of it may take, some of it may not take, you do not know till the end, right, but at the end of the day, we get to see our product and we get to see whether it works and whether we did get it right and whether we did think about all the elements that we need to put into a building or into a campus. I would like to say that we get to decide what gets done and what does not get done, but it clearly is and truly is a collaborative effort that we go through. Let me just say that Megan and Anton and their staffs all work rather extensively with the campuses, with the faculty, with the administrators, with the students to very much figure out what we need to get done. Most of it starts with a master plan and you know Megan could go on at length about how many master plans she has been involved in. It is a great tool for us to figure out the future. Now, sometimes we do a master plan like in the case of John Jay, which said you needed another building and it took us almost two decades to get the building built. Also in the case of Medgar Evers, the master plan said that the college needed a new building but it took what 24 years to get that site.
So, we like to start with the master plans and that gives us justification when we have to go to the powers that be, to either get approval or to get money to do the projects that we have to do. When I got here in 2007 it was just the beginning: the State does five year capital plans and what they do is give you a lump of money at the beginning of the five years, sometimes they add to it over the five years and sometimes they do not.

When I arrived, one of the first things I had to do is negotiate the five year plan with the State and we ended up getting that year $1.6 billion from the State for all of CUNY for a number of projects. As many of you heard, the Chancellor had decreed that it was the Decade of the Sciences and we had many projects that were designed and ready to go in terms of science projects for CUNY. Some of them were not science projects. Some of them where either performing art centers or gyms but much of the theme was the Decade of the Sciences.

I would like to take credit and say that once I arrived I got $1.6 billion, but that was not the case. A lot of people before me had worked very hard on getting that money and as a result of that money we were able to start and put into the ground a number of projects of which four opened up this fall.

I spoke with Don Farley [who held her position in the 1970s and 1980s.] He said we had the largest number of openings at CUNY probably in the history of CUNY. Don came in 1947 so he would have remembered! Don was me two people ago so Don would remember and while CUNY is an institution of higher education, of higher learning, but I like to say that we are a very important partner of the City of New York and when you talk about opening up four buildings, when you talk about receiving from the State $1.6 billion to do construction, in my mind we are also an economic engine of the City. We act as the economic development of the City which is very important when you think about it, when you think about what we as CUNY offer the City, and what we give back.

So if you go to any of our construction sites, the first thing I always ask is how many people are working? How many people do we have on the job? This is very important and was particularly so a few years ago when the economy was in the toilet and then it was really important. So we are always striving to get that message out that we are not just taking but we give back and then when a building like the new John Jay building opens up we add permanent jobs. You have people who clean, people who work in the buildings, and all that adds to the economy of the City.

I would like to tell you that going forward the next five-year or 10-year plan will be as rich for CUNY but I do not think it will be. The reason for that is that the Governor has now created an entity called New York Works and what New York Works is, it is an oversight commission and there are a lot of individuals who have been appointed and the goal of the Governor is to say that the State gave a lot of money to CUNY and SUNY over the last 10 years and that we spent that money and created beautiful buildings but in the interim we did not take care of our dams and aqueducts and we did not take care of our transportation systems and we did not take care of our environmental issues and so basically what the Governor said is that now everybody has to compete in the same pot for the same amount of money.

It used to be, before, that higher education went in and we got our little pot of money and then the department of transportation went in next and they got their little pot of money, but that is not the case anymore. Now we all have to compete and the Governor is going to use certain criteria to decide who gets what. I will say one of the criteria is how much money did you get in the last five-year or 10-year plan.
Does that mean we are going to get nothing? No, because we have a number of projects that are in construction now, a number that we are going to break ground on in the next few weeks, and the State has made a commitment to fund those projects.

I think the next two or three years economically is going to be very hard for the State in terms of funding capital projects. They are approaching the limit of the debt limit for these types of projects and so you know, it is going to be a two or three year period where maybe we will get one or two projects through but we may not get the six or eight that we had gotten in the last capital plan.

So what will we do in the case that we do not get a very robust capital plan? As I said there are projects that are going in the ground, that are in the ground that the State has made a commitment to complete. We have gotten a huge amount of money for critical maintenance. We got $1.4 billion separate from the $1.6 billion that they gave us and that $1.4 billion over the last five years was just for critical maintenance.

So what does that mean - critical maintenance? I know it is not very sexy but it is money to fix escalators and elevators and HVAC Systems and leaky roofs, stuff that you know, you who are in the classrooms and you who are in the buildings know that this is crucial. I always like to say there is never an escalator in CUNY that is not broken or has not been broken. So you know, we are spending a huge amount of money doing these critical maintenance projects, some of them are very small but some of them are truly very large and they are going to change the whole nature of the fabric of the campuses.

One example is that Bronx Community College where we have a horrible problem with our HVAC system and with our cooling system and our heating system. If you go in that campus now, there are huge pits where we are actually just digging up the old system and putting a new system in. We have an enormous project that is going to start for LaGuardia Community College - some of you may know Center Three - it is the biggest building, probably second biggest building in CUNY. The façade of Center Three was originally built as the Nabisco Cracker Factory. Nothing has been touched on that façade in 100 years and over the last few years large chunks of the façade have come down. Now we are lucky they have not come down on people but sometimes your luck wears off.

We have gotten a commitment, because it is a community college, from both the City and the State - 50:50 with each - to do a new façade project at LaGuardia. That is going to be a $100 million project. Again, is it adding more square footage to CUNY? The answer is no but it is an important building, one that we have to maintain and one for which we are responsible to keep its upkeep.

So, on critical maintenance, as I said, there are huge numbers of projects. I think Bob [a senior member of her staff] told me there is something like 442 projects. Now you should also remember in the past we would go to elected officials to try and get critical maintenance money. Nobody wanted to give us critical maintenance money and it was for one reason and one reason only. They said how am I supposed to take credit if you put a new boiler in? Who is going to see the new boiler? I will pay for a lab, I will pay for a music room, because I can put my little plaque up! So you could imagine the challenge that we had trying to get this type of money and now we do not have to go to elected officials.

So regarding John Jay, which I know is what you are most concerned and interested in. Let me just say that I think it is very exciting that we have this new building. Jeremy tells me often that it has changed both the feeling of the school and his ability to get more students and better students to come to John Jay which I think is a wonderful thing.
I think that the design of this building is nothing short of spectacular and I like to say when I speak about the building that it is one of these buildings of CUNY that has a little bit of everything, you know, it is not really a science building, it is not really an academic building, it is not really student services building. It has it all and it has food and it has places for students to work and to relax and that is another point. In the last five years what we have done is, we have stepped back and looked at what our students need.

Students are spending more time on campus. They do not necessarily need libraries but they need spaces where they can study or just do some homework. They need space to be able to work in groups and whether it is at the new John Jay building or Baruch or the new library at Bronx Community College, we have incorporated all those elements.

I think, as you all know, we work across the street – we are in the BMW Building as you are. There are sometimes when I have a bad day at work and what I will do is I will just get up and if you guys are having classes at the time, I will just walk across the street and I come into this building and I just see students using the space the way that we designed it and it makes you feel good because at the end of the day you say, gee I did some right, I did something good.

Karen already spoke about all the elements that we put back into the building: Anton was a major advocate of it and did not leave me alone for months until I agreed to do it all. Karen talked about SOM. My philosophy is that you are the end user, this is your building, at the end of the day we helped to design it, we helped program it for you, but at the end of the day when the project is done, we hand the key over to you and it is your building. So why would I impose what I like versus what you like?

I remember in particular one meeting about the furniture, do you remember that meeting?

Senate President Kaplowitz: Yes I do.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Yes I remember. The furniture was just ugly and the colors were ugly. The architects were trying to push this down your throat. I said enough, I said you do not live here. They live here... They do not like it. You've got to pick something else.

So in the end we were able to achieve that. Putting the additional foundations in the building cost us about $10 million. At the end of the day, when you think about it, we made a $10 million investment in the future of John Jay, because if you grow and you get bigger, we have the ability to build on top of the open space.

Now I would hate to do it because I think the open space is a great element but life is long and you never know what is going to happen and in particular you are an urban campus, you are in the middle of the upper west side of Manhattan, what is the likelihood that we would be ever be able to assemble a site, to be able to build the space that you need? How much air right is above there?

Director Moore-Wilk: 230

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: 230,000 square feet. I think, you know, we will be whistling in the wind trying to get that type of parcel together.

A Senator: We can live with a higher-up Jay Walk on the roof of the expansion!
Vice Chancellor Weinshall: I am with you. So you know, we felt that this was a wise investment of $10 million to put those elements back. Lastly, you know the fins that are on the building: I mean they are not just an architectural statement, they have to do with the sun and the lighting and the way that it hits the building and so we felt that it was important to put those elements back. Also if you took them out, you have a pretty dull boring building to look at.

So we just felt very strongly about putting these items back and we were able to convince the people of all the need and that overall this was a good $120 million investment.

I spoke about the Decade of the Sciences. We have some very exciting science labs in this building, some very exciting science space. If we had phased the opening of the building, do you think we would have now achieved the last piece of it? Am I right?

So that space would be able to be used by the students. Our greatest challenge for our Manhattan campuses, if we take City College out of the equation, but if you include BMCC and Hunter and Baruch, is to be able to find the land to be able to build and accomplish what we have to accomplish.

I will tell you that as a university, when they came to colleges like Hunter and Baruch, we made a huge mistake 10 and 15 years ago. We should have been doing what the hospitals did on the Upper East Side. We should have started to assemble sites that we could build on and build on some and, you know, we are sort of paying the piper now because it is almost impossible to be able to put together sites, whether it is 230,000 square feet, or the 500,000 square feet that Hunter needs for their new science building, it is literally impossible to be able, at least on a cost effective basis, to put together those sites.

Senator Benton: But you have done some impressive deals with the hospitals...

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: We have. That was one of the things I was going to talk about. We have started to do some very interesting, exciting public-private partnerships. One was announced early this fall, where we are going to partner with Sloan-Kettering. Through this partnership we were able to buy the land, actually Sloan-Kettering was able to buy the land, and it is nice to have a partner who has a very deep pocket. We gave up the labs at Brookdale [on 25th Street and First Avenue], so that Sanitation put their garage down there. Sloan-Kettering is going to hire the architects, hire the contractors, so we do not have to worry about the Wicks law, we do not have to worry about this elongated process, and hopefully these two buildings will go up together at record pace.

So Ned is right. We have done some interesting things partnering with private entities, and that has helped us to do some projects. We have some real estate assets that may not be of total value to us, but to our private partners are of great value.

So what is going to happen with John Jay in the future? I guess this is the last thing I want to talk about, and then I would be happy to take questions. First, we are doing some checking to make sure I get the projects right. We are doing some projects here in Haaren Hall, like I said before, critical maintenance. We are doing a roof replacement project and we are doing some interior work so that Haaren Hall can get its certificate of occupancy.
Remember, DASNY [Dormitory Authority of NYS] did many of our projects. They were exempt from the City building code. So they built to the State code and, therefore, we never got certificates of occupancy.

We are also doing an elevator upgrade in this building, and again it’s not a very sexy project, not something that elected officials would want to give us money for, but you know what it means to have an elevator upgrade, elevators that work in a good manner. For the work that we are going to do in Haaren Hall, we will probably move some people out, and some functions out, and move them into North Hall temporarily, and then when that work is done we will move them back into Haaren Hall.

So you may ask what is going to happen to North Hall. We had an agreement with the State when they gave us the approval to build the New Building, and I hope by the way, the President gets money to name that building. I am tired of calling it the New Building you know. It will not be so new in a little while, but it is the New Building.

**Senate President Kaplowitz:** Naming a building requires a gift of $125 million.

**Vice Chancellor Weinshall:** I know. So the deal with the State was: we will let you go ahead and build this new building but you are going to have to give up North Hall because we are giving you 640,000 square feet in the new building. So we were going along on our merry way assuming we would give up North Hall and the State would take the building back.

As time has progressed, as many of you have known, yet another new project, a new community college, was created here at CUNY and we have a temporary home for that new community college. But it is in leased space in midtown and actually we are lucky because it was actually a school, it was a Katharine Gibbs School. They went out of business. I guess people do not want to learn to be executive assistants anymore. So we are in that building for this leased space for 10 years.

We went back to the State and we said: we have an idea, we have a concept for the North Hall and what made it very appealing to the State was that we were going to do a public-private partnership. What are we going to do? The building, although it is a low-rise building, has a lot of air rights above it and in total the building has about 800,000 square feet worth of air rights. Way too much for a community college. The community college may need 350,000 square feet and so we went back to the State and said we will sell the rest of the air rights, and take that money, and put it into the new building. So that would be $100 million less that you would have to give us. And this government in particular loves the idea of public and private entity, sort of marrying and working together. They have basically said, let us wait another fiscal year to see how the economy goes, and then we will let you proceed with the new community college.

This is why we were able to use the space for John Jay and have stuff that we are doing in Haaren Hall going to North Hall temporarily, because we know we are not going to use the building for at least another year. It is a very exciting project.

I must also tell you we just sold 80th Street, you know the Central Office is moving to 42nd Street. So I am always worried - what are they going to call the Central Office now? Is it still going to be called the 80th Street or are they going to call 42nd Street.

**Senate President Kaplowitz:** 80th Street at 42nd Street?
Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Yes, that is what I think. So, we just sold the 80th Street building, and you know there is nothing like owning real estate in New York in the right neighborhoods, and selling it. We had a rather competitive process and the University received $62 million for 80th Street. It is going to be the highest per-square-foot deal for a residential building for this year. I think we are getting close to $600 a square foot, which is a lot of money. And, by the way, a chunk of that money is going into the ASRC [Science Research] Complex up in City College up in Harlem, where we are going to fund all the high-end equipment that the State never budgeted for. So again we are taking an under utilized asset which was 80th Street and we are taking the proceeds and putting it into a project.

So let me just end by saying that we live in very exciting challenging times here at CUNY, and whether on the academic side or the physical side, you know, I will say this - that I am very fortunate to work for a Chancellor who believes in design excellence, truly does.

I always like to say - whether you are hiring a good architect or a bad architect, you are going to pay the same amount of money, so you might as well hire the better architect - the SOMs, the Robert Stern’s, the Jim Polshek’s, you might as well hire them because you are going to pay the same whether you hire them, or crappy architects.

And we have a Chancellor who is not afraid to take risks when it comes to real estate and assets, and to push my division to do more, and to be more creative. So we are really operating in pretty exciting times and, you know, we opened four buildings this fall and I hope that we will get to a place in a few years from now where we can do the same, where we can open another four buildings. That is my goal - to keep the projects going to the point where we can get them completed.

Senate President Kaplowitz: It sounds like you are having tremendous fun.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Oh yes, a lot of aggravation but a lot of fun.

Senator Ned Benton: I would first say that we all struggled to try to figure out what to temporarily call the new building. And whether maybe there was an alternative to calling it the “New Building.” So the question came up - what do we, in criminal justice, call someone whose name and identity is not yet known? Some of us thought we could ask the Chancellor if we could call it the “John Doe Building” or maybe the “Unsub Building.” Those temporary names would fit with a college with criminal justice as its mission!

As you know, I have been working on space issues for quite a long time and I hear many comments by faculty and students and staff about our space. We are so profoundly thankful to CUNY and for the attention that we have gotten with respect to space, and for our fabulous new building. It is just marvelous. But there was more. Moving beyond the New Building, what did you do? You did not tell the rest of the story - about the backfill. My department will move into the renovated space right below us.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Right.

Senator Benton: And what you have done is to take a bunch of spaces that were designed for facilities management and services. There was a locker room, a kitchen and two bathrooms and a shower...

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: ...and that was just your office!
Senator Benton: Right! I have been most grateful! But now you are turning the space that we were to occupy into much more usable space, many more offices in the same overall space, and it may be the most cost-effective additional office space that CUNY has ever developed. You take old spaces and right-size them and renovate them. You do critical maintenance projects. You do projects like the science labs, redoing science labs around CUNY and, at a relatively low cost, you create state-of-the-art labs out of spaces that were old and unusable. This is really terrific, and it is really exciting to watch it all happen.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Let me just say something about the lab projects. Another thing when I arrived is there were, at older campuses, labs that had basically been locked up that nobody could use because they dated back to the 40s and 50s and 60s. There was a pot of money that CUNY had that we had not used for facilities upgrades and we went back to the State and we said, could we use this money as a lab initiative? We would pick out one or two or three projects at one or two or three campuses. The goal was not to change the HVAC System, not to change where the lighting came in. But we did a little renovation in the labs - new hoods, new lighting, new case work - and I think so far we have done . . .

Director Moore-Wilk: 35 labs including instruction and research, 35.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: And, I have to tell you, it is truly amazing to see the transformation that these labs have made. So it saved a lot of money. Each lab costs us maybe $2 to 2.5 million which is, you know, in our world not a lot of money for a lab. The way that we did it was we let out all the requirement contracts, so neither the campus nor we had to go out for each project and hire an architect, hire a CM. We did that ahead of schedule, and then we just basically said we will go through a mini-process and we will pick, you know, this firm for this campus, that firm for that campus. And it has made a huge difference on the campuses.

Senate President Kaplowitz: You showed some of us photographs. Before and after. It was shocking before.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Rooms that I walked into - no one was using them - right? - because they could not stay in those rooms.

Senate President Kaplowitz: And then after, it is just wonderful, including the right vents with the right lighting.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Yes. And I possibly took my science courses in some of those labs when I was there! So I just had to see what they looked like.

Senator Benton: Your approach, trying to look creatively at the situation that you have identified, the problems, to come up with efficient, creative and out-of-the-box solutions, this approach is infectious. As Senator and as Chairs, we serve as faculty members on our Strategic Planning Committee. This committee combines our strategic planning about the college, including assessment, and with our analysis of our space needs.

We are trying to make the best use of our space. Like you, we are trying to think outside-the-box about how we will make the best use of our space, not necessarily saying there is only one answer, not saying that you have to give us a new building or you've got to give us something large, because that may not be forthcoming.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: No.
Senator Benton: So we are trying to come up with new ideas - some that can work to solve some of our problems within the space that we have. We can re-make the space that we have, and we can rethink how we do things. We have initiated a process to identify our key space problems, and the problems include having, immediately, another 35 to 50 new faculty members coming on when in some departments we do not have offices for them.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Right.

Senator Benton: We have to figure this out, not just for the present, as you know this is going to go on for a while. So we are trying to figure out what to do about it for the future. Also, the administration, the Faculty Senate, and the Chairs identified a set of departments that are going to grow, but that are land-locked. They are in a space where, if they grow anymore, they are growing into another department that is growing in the other direction. Or, they are growing into the Advising Program offices, or growing into other departments. So we are trying to highlight which departments those are, what can be done about it. Also, do we have departments that are the reverse - they are not growing and not land-locked, and maybe we can move things around a bit and find a different way to use our space.

We have also been looking at what happens with our change from a comprehensive college to a senior college. We are having fewer freshmen and sophomores, more juniors and seniors, and that means we will have more students who are in upper level classes that are smaller class sections. We are seeing that the portfolio of classrooms that we need is changing, and so we have been trying to identify some larger classrooms that we now could turn into smaller classrooms. When we do this, we can have twice as many classrooms without much additional cost.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Yes.

Senator Benton: We are working on that as well as trying to look at our online instruction - not necessarily fully online but we are looking at that too - but even hybrid classes that would meet once a week rather than twice a week. We could fit twice as much instruction in the same classroom space. We are looking for where we can judiciously do that.

We are asking hard questions about all of our space use. We have research projects which need space and these projects are critical to our academic mission, and they are critical to the identity of the college.

We know that Westport comes up for renewal in 2014, BMW comes up for renewal in 2015 and then eventually 54th Street also comes up. We know that our leased space, some of it at least, has not fit well with what we need it for. We want to take the opportunity to examine whether we want this space the way it is. Could there be some kind of a creative trade that might be made - in the same spirit as the other creative trades that you have made - to come up with something that would better meet our needs. We would try to first work within the resources that we have, or something that would not be that much different from it.

Now, to accomplish that, there is much we can do ourselves. We are studying where the faculty lines are going to be allotted, and we are studying, with the registrar, the classroom space issues.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Yes.
Senator Benton: You know that we are looking at a lot of these things, and we feel that we need a space consultant to help us put this together a set of options for you to consider. I know that we did this once before and I recall that the space consultant came up with a plan that said we needed a whole lot of new space –

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: They usually do!

Senator Benton: Well, you know I am sure that our space consultant will devote some pages to explaining that we really, really, really need a whole lot of space! That being said, what we want to concentrate on is how to make the best use of the space we have, and make incremental expansions or changes that could get us more usable space for the functions that we need. We think that there is a point at which the space consultant can help us to package and identify those ideas in terms that could be used by Rob [Pignatello], by you, and by others to decide what to do next.

With respect to the space situation, the faculty, in our budget process last year, had to prioritize. We were given a list of projects, and there were various ideas we added to the list, including $60,000 for a space consultant. Now we do not know whether $60,000 is the right number, but it is in the neighborhood for a space consultant. The Chairs and the Faculty Senate gave that a very high priority. We said we really needed that, and the administration agreed with us, and put it in our budget even though it was cutting into other things.

There were things that the Registrar would have liked to have done with that money, things that faculty would have liked, but we prioritized it. But we know our proposal does not work unless you think it is a good idea, unless you want to work with the idea. So our wish is that we would like to see you give that some consideration - in the spirit of the way of which we want this to go forward. We are not going to be pitching you something that is going to be totally unreasonable.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: I would just comment on a couple of aspects of space. CUNY has not redone our space standards since 1973. A lot has happened since 1973. What students need has changed. Computers now are a big part of our lives. Smart phones are big part. So this is what Meghan has been working on, and maybe she could talk a little bit about it. We are in the process of redoing CUNY's space standards which we hope will be a great tool not only for ourselves but for the campuses as well.

The second thing is that on many campuses, and it may be happening here, I do not know, but two years ago we started to look. Megan and her staff have an ability to see usage measures on all of our 24 campuses, all 300 buildings. We have an ability to see whether classrooms are being used, and how many students are in those classrooms.

Director Moore-Wilk: These are classrooms; unfortunately labs are not in the system.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: We realized that the space belongs to the registrars, because they are the ones who figure out whether Psych 101 is going to be in this space or that space. And what we realized was that on many campuses, classrooms and spaces belong to certain departments. So you may have a classroom that can seat 45 people but it belongs to the history department and that particular section only has 20 people in it.

And then I feel like going to that classroom for criminal justice, but it is history's classroom, it is on their floor, it is part of the history department. This does not make sense, and we had the registrars in for a couple of meetings about this, and let me tell you it was like pulling teeth. I mean they were ground in. You know we
found that on one campus they did not use a room at all, or very little, because they had a piano in it. So why don't you move the piano? You do not use the room because there is a piano in it? I mean truly - stuff like that.

**Senate President Kaplowitz:** Or place the piano in the corner, and everyone else can sit in the rest of the classroom!

**Vice Chancellor Weinshall:** Right. I also hear what you are saying about leased space. It is both a curse and a benefit to have leased space. It is very hard to create true and good academic space in leased buildings although we are in a lot of leased buildings. It is a great benefit for CUNY that we are able to be in many leased buildings because without them we really would have an enormous space deficit in the university. Meghan - maybe you might talk about the space standards study that we are going through.

**Director Moore-Wilk:** As Iris said, we have not updated them since 1973. So, for example, through the years we were planning a new building for John Jay. We did not simply just go to the 1973 numbers. We looked at benchmarking at our institutions to other universities, and we have been doing that. But we really need a tool that you all could start with - to plug in and say there is a chair and five faculty and three adjuncts and an administrative assistant - and what kind of space does that generate.

We would want to be able to put in your contact hours and say how many classrooms, square footage, would these hours generate. So we have been working on it. I wish that it was happening faster. It is a little bit slower process than I would like but we have to get the formulas right before we develop some version of a database tool that you could then use.

I have to say again, I know John Jay better than any of the other campuses. I have been in CUNY for 17 years. I know, from when we created the new building program and your design process, you use space in many more ways, and in more creative ways.

You know we did the Jay Walk. It can be a place for students, for student events in the evening and we could even have lectures there.

You guys have got to have your laundry list written down because you are going to have a hard time remembering whose priority comes first. So we will work with you. We know very well that John Jay has worked out a planning process to begin with.

Hopefully, by the spring we will start to have a tool that we can come back to you with. We could even use John Jay maybe to test it, and we could look at some your numbers. We need to look at both your current room needs and, as you said, which departments are growing, where the resources are going to be increased, and where maybe some things are either staying static or maybe even not as popular as they once were when you had associate programs.

**Vice Chancellor Weinshall:** I think you will need two consultants. I do not think you just need a programmer to look at what you need, because that person will just tell us that you need a lot more space. But you also need a partner - an architect - with the programmer who can then look at your facilities and options, they can look at the space and say that this is an opportunity to cut a classroom in two or something. So we want to work with you to figure out what that scope really is.
Senator President Kaplowitz: Excellent.

Senator Benton: We are ready to put money in it.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Yes.

Senator Benton: If we can do this, it would be extremely valuable.

Senator President Kaplowitz: This is Professor Jill Grose-Fifer from the Psychology Department, and she is going to describe the current research she does and tell you how she is challenged by space.

Professor Jill Grose-Fifer: So first of all I would like to say that I love my new office. It is on the 10th floor of the New Building and I think my family thinks that I love my new office a bit too much. I find myself there many hours on the weekend and it is really great to be there and to be working in there. So thank you! And I love the furniture too!

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Good.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: This is something else that we have done new since I have come to CUNY. It used to be that we would just order the furniture. And Karen knows this, you know what I said to SOM – “No no, no you’ve got to build it out, so people could sit in it and feel it, and know if it works. Is the chair okay? Is the desk okay?” Now we have done that in all the campuses where we have had new buildings, we do mock-ups, and for some campuses we’ve picked two different systems, and we say to faculty: “You can vote on what you want! You have to live with it. I am not living here at your space.”

Senator President Kaplowitz: I remember when the furniture was displayed for us. Not only was it ugly, but it was uncomfortable. One chair I literally slid out of! It was a wooden chair and the seat was on such a severe tilt that there was no way we could accept it! But the rep said, “Oh no, no, no, but this is a really popular chair” but it was terrible.

Senator Benton: It was like an interrogation chair. It was designed to make the subject feel uncomfortable.

Senator President Kaplowitz: Yes, you literally could not stay seated on it.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: At another building, we just opened Federal Hall in Lower Manhattan, the architect and his firm does a lot of stuff with interesting furniture. They did a display there. They did a presentation on the furniture. Do you remember the TV show, the Jetsons! I look at the furniture and I feel like I am back, like I am in this show the Jetsons! I said this, and he said the same thing – exactly “No, no, no this is very popular.” Yes it may be popular but it’s very ugly and dysfunctional.

Professor Jill Grose-Fifer: My research looks at adolescent brain development so I am really interested in looking at what is different about adolescence, why is adolescence a period of risk taking and so I am a cognitive neuro-scientist really. So I have an EEG lab where I do my research.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Also in the new building?
Professor Jill Grose-Fifer: Yes, also in the new building. It is very close to my office, very convenient, but it is very small. It is a small room about the same size as my office. I do have EEG equipment now to grow my team, but it limits the kind of research that I do because we can only run one process at a time. You know, we can only have so many people come in the lab at a time. I have two doctoral students that I am working with, several masters’ students, several undergraduate students and we have to have a very strict procedure in terms of who could be in the lab.

It is just a very difficult set-up, I had somebody come from Hunter to see if they could rotate into my lab in the spring, but during the conversation she realized that we were not sitting in the lab because it was too small. I have to collect and analyze the data in the same small room. We do not have a sink where we can wash the equipment. We have to go around the corner in to the kitchen area. So it really means than I am much less productive than I could be if I had a more conventional suite of rooms.

It also means that it limits my ability to apply for external funding because I do not have the space. I cannot say I would like to have a post-doc because we do not have space for the post-doc. So, although the new building is very wonderful, the research space is not adequate.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: I came in 2007 but the design was started in 2003, and one of the issues with research throughout the university is that oftentimes capital projects are great but they take a long time. So the folks that someone has to design with at the start of a project may not be the same folks at the end. I guess what I would ask is, looking at the whole floor, what else you have there and who else is on the floor. We worked for a lot for this project, and yet the day we open a building, it is outmoded and we clearly do not have enough space for everybody. So I hear what you are saying and, unfortunately or fortunately, what a lot of campuses do is that over time they begin to retrofit the spaces in their building. They start to make choices.

Senator Tom Kucharski: And that is what you would want to do?

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Right. It is okay. We build for a certain moment in time, but we work in a very dynamic industry, it is always changing. A building is never going to be just as you built it and then stay like that for 20 years. It is not possible because the university is growing. You are growing and changing. You are going to get more faculty, we all are getting more faculty, more students. So it is a process that is ongoing.

Director Moore-Wilk: One of the things we were thinking of - this is not just about the space planner, space consultant. Perhaps given the fact that two of the leases are coming up, that may make it possible to consolidate rental space so that it is of more efficient use and more flexible use.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Absolutely, if it is available and we can cut a deal with the landlord. I know it is hard for you guys to understand. There are many landlords who do not want to rent to educational use. You know, I am amazed about that, because I think we make the best tenants. Not only that, when we rent a space, it is like getting an automatic check every month. That check is kicked out of Albany and that check arrives come hell or high water, right. So, I think we are great, we are terrific.

But you know, some landlords say “No I am not going do that.” And, by the way, as Hudson Yards starts to take form, we will be squeezed up here further on the Upper West Side, because remember those big buildings are going to go in. They are going to start to knock down the little mom and pop operations and where are those folks going to go? They are going to start to come uptown to look for space. So the answer is yes, you know, we can look at that and we will try and work with whichever landlords want to cut deals.
I will tell you this: the folks of BMW building are very pleased with us. You know some of our central operations moved out of the BMW building - that is the IT - and we are moving a data center out very shortly. It is going to follow Brian [Cohen]. You should know that the lease was due just at the time as the market crashed and so we are very good tenants. We not only renewed our lease but we took more space in the building. So, they would love us right now and you know, I think that they are very eager to work with us.

Senate President Kaplowitz: We love the BMW building: if we could expand our space there and consolidate it there it would be excellent especially because it is so close.

Senator Benton: It's a great building, even though the actual configuration of the floors we have is not useful for faculty offices.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Well, the other thing is, as you renew your lease you know, every one, every landlord will give you money to redo his space. To us that is free money because they are saying I will give you money to reconfigure the space. The 58th street entrance of BMW is right next to the New Building entrance on 11th avenue and so it is really perfect.

Director Moore-Wilk: It feels like it is contiguous. We hardly got winded walking over here.

Senate President Kaplowitz: This is Bonnie Nelson who is a member of our Library faculty; right now she is our interim Head Librarian because our Librarian is on sabbatical.

Professor Nelson: Thank you for allowing me to come here. I am not a member of the Senate. I also enjoy the New Building though the Library is in the old building. One of the things I love actually is that the entrance on 11th Avenue has a bicycle rack inside and I frequently bike here and it is right off the West Side Highway and Bypass, so I do not have to go in that other building. I can enter the beautiful new building.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: You can appreciate that they changed the building code. Right, Anton! The changed code now requires any commercial building to provide a certain number of bike spots and I got to tell another project story. We were just at the cusp. If we have been a little bit faster we would have been under the old building code, but now we hit the new building code and if you go to [BMCC's] Fiterman Hall, we put a very interesting sort of setup for the bikes. We had to take away space from the lobby, and the bikes are put up on a rack and the doors are sliding doors, but from the outside you see these interesting bike racks. You do not see them from the lobby because we put up the sliding doors. So it is a wonderful little system that we have put in. As a matter of fact when we design the new Hunter building, we are thinking of putting the same system in because it is unique.

Professor Nelson: I will look definitely for it. I want to talk a little bit about the Library, and you had mentioned you do not think students necessarily need Libraries anymore.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: They do not still need stacks anymore. They do need the Libraries.

Professor Nelson: We had thought actually that once the New Building opens, it would get kind of empty in the Library and that is not really the case. We have 40,000 students walking through our doors every month.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Really.
Professor Nelson: It is enormous numbers of students. They are sitting on the floors because there are not enough seats. They are sitting on the floor and the Library now is 25 years old and when the Library opened in this building, there was not enough space.

Director Wolfshorndl: I have actually had discussions with the [John Jay] administration about planning a project to do a Library renovation.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: I know there have been some discussions about libraries, and I have attended some of them.

Director Wolfshorndl: It has not gone very far, but here have been some initial discussions about what the conditions are, what your needs are. I am aware of how heavily used the Library is. One issue is that you need to open up more space for students who actually have to sit and do work, because your stacks are kind of clogging up most of the space that you have in the Library.

Professor Nelson: And we are right now in the process of removing some of the old journals that nobody looks at, clogging up much of the space that we have in the Library. We moved out some of the old journals, and we made space to be opened up. But the Library was never well configured. It never worked well.

Director Wolfshorndl: You could see that walking through in there. You could really.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: So, Bonnie, can I tell you things. So this summer I was asked to go with [Vice Chancellor for Academic Affairs] Lexa Logue and [Vice Chancellor for Operations] Alan Dobrin to Princeton, New Jersey. Princeton University, the New York City Public Library, and Columbia have joined together to move all their stacks out of their libraries - as many as they can - to a facility in Princeton. The deal is the following: let us say you are a student and you want a book or you are a faculty member and you want a book, within 24 hours that book will be delivered to the Library. By hook or crook it has got to be there within 24 hours. I mean this place is amazing. It is just mile after mile of stacks of books.

So, this is something that we are beginning to think about and to look at ourselves. You go to the Library at City College and they have a whole engineering section. We were down there this summer looking at it. We found journals from 1902, 1903 and when we took the journals out of the shelf, the paper disintegrated. It fell apart. I do not think anyone has looked at that journal since 1902.

So that is number one, we were starting to think about that. We do not know what the right answer is, but we are beginning to think about that. They are part of this. Really, well they are partner in this. They are our partner there. So, that is number one.

The second thing is that we are doing some work on some libraries and I would encourage you to visit. I will be happy to have the ADs, who are working on it, get in touch with you. At Hunter, we are redoing a library. There the president has got a private gift and is getting more private gifts, which is allowing us to do just what Anton said, to look at the libraries and see how we could improve space. And then at Medgar Evers we moved the library to the Carroll Street facility. Now we are redoing their entire library.

What do you think? Yes, and by the way, at City College they did these all with their own money with in-house staff. They did not come to us all. For two years, they took some of their funds and squirreled them away.
They did not put any into any more technology. There, they removed stacks of books and they created the study spaces, just what you said, all using modular furniture and the space is nothing short of phenomenal.

I was so impressed with it. I made the Chancellor go up and look at it. For days, it is all he could talk about was that space. But it shows you that if you are innovative and creative on a campus you can do some stuff with the libraries. I would love to talk to you about those two campuses to see what they are doing. Okay?

**Senate President Kaplowitz:** Katherine Wylie Marques is from the Department of Communication and Theatre Arts.

**Senator Wylie Marques:** I remember about six years ago we received emails about the possibility of getting a partnership for faculty housing.

**Vice Chancellor Weinshall:** The answer is that we have been down this road quite a bit. I have been down this road quite a bit. We actually joined with the consortium that was looking to buy land and the people, who own it now, they are not so keen on selling it at this moment. They are holding onto it. I think they believe that there is an upside to holding onto the site.

We also tried to do a faculty housing project right next to the new Hunter School of Social Work in East Harlem. At the end of the day, when we ran the numbers, the apartments were just too expensive for our faculty, for junior faculty. It was also at the time when the market dipped and the faculty could go on Craig’s List and get a better apartment for less than what we could build for.

So, we have taken a pause. We have not stopped. We have taken a pause in this area. Because with what is going on in the market, and the needs of our faculty, we cannot get the right sweet spot to make the projects happen.

We did build graduate student housing at the East Harlem site. It is 93 beds for the graduate students and I think five or six apartments for faculty, and I do know that it is totally rented up. We were able to reach the sweet spot on that project because the Graduate Center got a $15 million dollar gift. So when you can put equity into a project and you own the land, you’ve got a home run.

**Senator Benton:** I will now speak as a department chair.

**Vice Chancellor Weinshall:** Okay.

**Senator Benton:** My department is Public Management. It is one of several departments – including Economics for which Jay Hamilton, here, is the Chair. There are a set of departments that were housed in North Hall, that are still there. We have a concern, one that contributes to the sense of urgency we have about doing space planning studies to make good use of our space.

According to the administration, our space use now in North Hall is greater than the space that we will be getting on the 5th floor with the Haaren backfill when we move over next year. In Public Management we are recruiting six new faculty members right now, and one of them whom we are negotiating with it is a leading scholar in drug court evaluation. If we succeed we would have two leading scholars in this area in the country.
Our candidate is listed among the top three “Rainmakers” at her university - Georgia State University – and in a national study of junior faculty in criminal justice. She has a research contract for a million dollars a year for five years. She is willing to bring much of it here, but she will need space. I know what I would do next fall because I can give her space in North Hall. I do not know what I will do after that and her alternative is that she will subcontract back with Georgia State University. They have space and will be glad to keep a chunk of this project, but I want us to have it. I do not want to split this up.

We have also got a big project with the Association of the Inspectors General going on in North Hall. We have the Academy for Critical Incident Analysis in North Hall. We have got to figure out what were going to do about when we return from North Hall in Fall 2014. We have really urgent practical problems and we know that Santa Claus will not be visiting.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Really! I though Santa Claus will be visiting.

Senator Benton: Okay, all right!

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: This is the right season for Santa.

Senator Benton: There is an urgent need for us to figure out how to make the best use of our space to achieve some of these priorities, because we cannot leave money on the table.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: I agree.

Senator Benton: These projects are too important.

Vice Chancellor Weinshall: Actually, do you want to talk to this?

Director Moore-Wilk: I think that certainly, as you looking at the full use of the New Building, whether it is Westport or some consolidated lease, you will have to look at and see what those grants and contracts need. That would be something that we would want to figure out - how to backfill into Haaren.

I know you all use your classrooms very well and you use them seven days a week, but if there was a classroom space that could be used for something like that, we could convert it to work rooms or something. If we do that, I can see why that would be priority.

We know that there will come in time when North Hall has to be empty and then we will work with you. I have to see. We know, particularly you and Karen know, that we sat at the table day in and day out during the planning for the new building.

The way faculty offices were going to be assigned originally, and how it ended up, was different. We did not have Westport when we designed it. We did not have the 54th Street building. You know we make the best use of the resources we have and we certainly will help you anyway we can. Any resources we have we will share with you.

Your campus is good at keeping all your classes on the bell schedule. But we found at one campus that they had eight different bell schedules during any given day. Every class started 15 minutes earlier or later in the bell schedule. It means that class rooms can’t be fully used.
So we know you are doing some other things already. You know that if there are bigger rooms that need to be subdivided so that you will get more classrooms, and that you can take another room off line because you will have two classrooms where that was one. We can certainly look at that with you.

**Senate President Kaplowitz:** This is the last question. Elvin Montgomery is a member of the Psychology Department.

**Senator Montgomery:** It will be brief. With regard to North Hall and including the future factors and planning, there is a room in North Hall that is very, very important to some of the adjuncts. It is room 3508 and is the only place in John Jay that I know that adjuncts from the different departments can come to interact.

**Vice Chancellor Weinshall:** Are there work stations there?

**Senator Montgomery:** There are computers and a printer that works; this is a very important factor in the job satisfaction and also intellectual work. And the adjuncts help each other on various issues, everything ranging from "where did you get that book" to writing papers. So hopefully in the future we will have some space for adjuncts to have interdisciplinary interaction. So I am pointing this out.

**Vice Chancellor Weinshall:** Before we would move all functions out of North Hall, working with Megan and with Anton, we would look within the existing campus or, if we have to lease additional space, to be able create the spaces you all have been taking about. We are not going to say, "Oh no! That is not going to exist anymore." It will just have to exist somewhere else.

**Director Moore-Wilk:** Right.

**Vice Chancellor Weinshall:** And will have to find the space to be able to do it.

**Senate President Kaplowitz:** Thank you so much for coming and thank you for what all you are doing.

**Vice Chancellor Weinshall:** Thank you.

**Vice Chancellor Weinshall:** Nice to meet you all.

**Senate President Kaplowitz:** You are always welcome.

**Vice Chancellor Weinshall:** Okay. No one else has ever asked me to come speak! Thank you for inviting me.

**Senate President Kaplowitz:** We’ll ask you to come back. Thank you very much, Meghan and Anton and Iris.