

Faculty Senate Minutes #164

John Jay College of Criminal Justice

February 5, 1998

3:30 PM

Room 630 T

Present (28): David Brotherton, Effie Papatzikou Cochran, Glenn Corbett, Edward Davenport, Jane Davenport, Kojo Dei, John Donaruma, Arlene Geiger, P.J. Gibson, Edward Green, Lou Guinta, Karen Kaplowitz, Kwando Kinshasa, Sandra Lanzone, Roy Lotz, Barry Luby, James Malone, Ellen Marson, Mary Ann McClure, Daniel Pinello, Charles Reid, Frederik Rusch, Lydia Segal, Ellen Sexton, Carmen Solis, Davidson Umeh, Agnes Wieschenberg, Bessie Wright

Absent (9): C. Jama Adams, George Andreopoulos, Michael Blitz, Don Goodman, Amy Green, Gavin Lewis, Deborah Nelson, Jacqueline Polanco, Adina Schwartz

Invited Guest: Professor Keith Markus (Psychology)

AGENDA

1. Report from the chair and announcements
2. Approval of Minutes #163 of the December 12 meeting
3. Report on Board of Trustees' actions & issues
4. Data on number of adjunct-taught introductory courses
5. Discussion: ways to mentor adjunct and new full-time faculty
6. Discussion: Spring '97, Spring '95, Fall '95 grading patterns
7. Discussion: improving our graduation and retention rates
8. Discussion of the February 11 College Council agenda

REVISED AGENDA

1. Announcements
2. Approval of Minutes #163 of the December 12 meeting
3. Motion to suspend the agenda
4. Discussion of a proposal presented at today's 2 PM P&B meeting to close John Jay's Associate Degree programs

1. Announcements from the chair

Senator Roy Lotz (Sociology) was welcomed as a new at-large representative of the full-time faculty.

Interim Chancellor Christoph M. Kimmich has been invited to a Faculty Senate meeting and he has accepted. The date is to be determined. [The date of Friday, May 8, has since been selected.]

Manhattan Borough President Virginia Fields has also accepted our invitation **and** will come to the Senate's Wednesday, March 18, meeting. The executive committee believes that, especially given the unrelenting attacks on CUNY in the media and by others, the new Borough President of Manhattan should be as knowledgeable as

possible about John Jay as soon as possible. Additionally, John Jay has requested \$1.7 million in capital funds for specific projects from the Office of the Manhattan Borough President. John Jay has never received capital funds from the Manhattan Borough President although requests from the other Manhattan CUNY colleges have been funded. John Jay's requests will be circulated to the Senate prior to Borough President Fields' meeting with us.

On March 5, Trustee Alfred Curtis will be the Senate's guest. Appointed to the CUNY Board by Mayor Giuliani during the summer, Trustee Curtis is a graduate of the College of Staten Island. He is the Mayor's appointee as the director of the United Nations Development Corporation and is the former head of the Staten Island branch of the NAACP.

Barnes & Noble Manager Fernando Cuevas has reported to President Kaplowitz that the faculty far exceeded its previous rate of on-time book orders and he asked that his thanks be conveyed to the Senate and through the Senate to the faculty. Mr. Cuevas felt that the discussion and the Senate's minutes reporting that discussion were invaluable. He asked whether the faculty have any complaints about any aspect of their book orders. He thinks everything went smoothly but would like to know the faculty's opinion. The Senate members reported they know of no problems and commended Mr. Cuevas.

Professor Keith Markus (Psychology), a psychometrician, was welcomed. He has offered to help the Senate analyze data on grade distribution patterns and on whether there is grade inflation. This agenda item will be visited at a future meeting because of today's P&B meeting which requires the Senate's attention today.

2. Approval of Minutes #163

By a motion duly made and carried, Minutes #163 of the December 12, 1997, meeting were adopted.

3. Motion to suspend the agenda

A motion was adopted to suspend the agenda in order to discuss the proposal to close our associate degree program that was presented today at 2 PM at a special P&B meeting.

4. Discussion of the proposal to close John Jay's associate degree program presented at today's 2 PM meeting of the P&B

President Kaplowitz reported that a phonemail message was sent the previous day announcing a special, emergency meeting of the College P&B Committee for today at 2 PM, which she attended. This meeting was in response to a CUNY press release just issued reporting that the 7 CUNY senior colleges that do not have associate degrees have raised their standards for admission since 1995 and that they plan to further raise their admissions requirements for Fall 1998. Senator Ellen Marson, who is also an at-large representative on the P&B, is still at the P&B meeting and will report to the Senate about the remainder of the P&B meeting upon its adjournment.

President Kaplowitz noted that President Lynch, as well as she and Professors Tom Litwack and Ned Benton, were at the February 2 meeting of the Board of Trustees Committee on Academic Program Planning and Review (CAPPR) -- she is the alternate faculty member on CAPPR and Professor Benton was invited by Trustee Marino to give a report on funding allocations to the Board's Fiscal Affairs Committee, which met immediately after the CAPPR meeting. At CAPPR, the Trustees reviewed a report on the admissions requirements of the 7 senior colleges without associate degree programs and discovered that those 7 senior colleges have been raising their admissions requirements in phases since 1995 and plan to further raise admission requirements for Fall 1998. The Trustees are scheduled at their next meeting, on March 2, to review the admissions requirements at the other four senior colleges, those with associate degree programs.

At today's P&B meeting, President Lynch proposed closing John Jay's associate degree program for a series of reasons which he presented. The CUNY press release was issued yesterday by the Chancellor, subsequent to that February 2 CAPPR meeting, and in the press release the seven senior colleges without associate degrees are separated out from the 4 senior colleges with associate degrees and places, therefore, John Jay into a second tier; the press release, copies of which were distributed at the P&B, is headlined "CUNY senior colleges raise admissions requirements for Fall 1998." The press release states: "A review of admissions criteria and a further strengthening of standards is anticipated at CUNY senior colleges which offer associate programs -- Medgar Evers, the College of Staten Island, John Jay College of Criminal Justice, and New York City Technical College."

President Lynch also told the P&B that Vice Chancellor for Academic Affairs Louise Mirrer has made an appointment to meet with him early next week to discuss our associate degree programs and that he wanted to hear responses to his proposal before that meeting. The question is whether we want to initiate action now at this moment when the University and, soon, John Jay are scrutinized in terms of admissions criteria and academic standards. President Kaplowitz noted that changes, if any, in our programs require a majority vote by the College Council.

Another reason presented by President Lynch is that we have a 4 percent associate degree graduation rate, a statistic which he said would embarrass the College were it to be reported in the media. Furthermore, he said, students do not want our associate degrees because they cannot make use of them and that, unlike associate degrees in such fields as radiation technology which are required for eligibility to take the State licensing exams, our associate degrees are not required for any job or license. Indeed, President Lynch reported, our students who qualified for associate degrees were automatically sent letters inviting them to pick up their diploma [a proposal from the Faculty Senate to the Curriculum Committee which the Curriculum Committee adopted] and virtually no students did so and thus, he said, our students are conveying their sense of the uselessness of the degrees to them.

President Lynch also said we could attract better prepared students if John Jay were not perceived, as it is by some, as a community college and that our associate degree programs are in reality an alternate entrance into our baccalaureate degree programs. He said we would still provide access through our SEEK Program, which Dean Rubie Malone then explained to the P&B is a

baccalaureate program, not an associate degree program. President Lynch spoke of his support of providing remediation to those students we do accept and Freshman Director Pat Sinatra noted that 25% of our baccalaureate degree students require remediation.

President Lynch also spoke of the focus of the CUNY Trustees and of Mayor Giuliani on admission standards and graduation rates and he also said that Middle States, the accrediting association, which is conducting its five-year review of John Jay this year, keeps asking him why is it that almost none of our students earn an associate degree and why do we have such programs if students don't earn those degrees.

President Kaplowitz said that the Business Director told the P&B that although he is absolutely committed to access, in his role as financial advisor he must advise that ending the associate degree programs and reducing enrollment would not hurt the College fiscally if it were done now. Senator John Donaruma questioned why this is so. President Kaplowitz said the Business Director explained that former Chancellor Ann Reynolds' directive that CUNY's enrollment must grow is no longer CUNY policy and enrollment growth by a college will no longer be rewarded and if we reduce enrollment now when colleges are being urged to raise standards we would not be harmed and, in fact, we would have more dollars per FTE student because our base budget would remain the same. We now have a base budget of \$30 million for 11,000 students and we would still have a \$30 million base if we had fewer students, just as has been the case at Brooklyn and City, which has lost enrollment dramatically. The idea is that colleges are being encouraged to increase standards without the fear of a negative fiscal impact. But it was acknowledged at the P&B that the VATEA grants that Senator Lou Guinta has obtained, and which can only be used for associate degree students and which provide tutoring and counseling as well as equipment, would be affected.

Senator Edward Green suggested that there would be a decline in the number of courses we offer since we would have fewer students and, thus, adjunct faculty would be affected.

President Kaplowitz reported that she had spoken in favor of closing the associate degree program, given the information, especially the fiscal analysis and the graduation rate, and that others also supported the proposal and some spoke in opposition. She said she had not had the benefit of consulting with the Senate because the meeting was called only the previous day and she only learned the topic of the P&B meeting 10 minutes before it began.

Senator Lou Guinta said he regrets that President Kaplowitz had been put in a situation where she had to speak as Senate President without having a chance to consult with the Senate and without having the viewpoints of members of the Senate. She agreed that she had not had time to consult, having learned the topic of the P&B meeting just minutes before the meeting began. She added that upon leaving the P&B, she announced she was coming to a Senate meeting and would consult with the Senate.

Senator Arlene Geiger asked how many of our students are associate degree students. President Kaplowitz said we need more detailed data but in our overall student body, 20% are associate degree students although the freshman classes of the last two years had much higher percentages of associate degree students.

Senator Guinta agreed that we have a very low graduation rate

in our associate degree programs and said it is because, as already pointed out, the program is actually a backdoor for students who really want to be in our baccalaureate degree programs. He said a large proportion of our students are admitted to the associate program and then transfer into our baccalaureate program. He said 20% is not an accurate number but rather 30% to 40% of our students were admitted through our associate degree programs or are currently associate degree students. So we are talking about a diminution of possibly 30% to 50% of our student body if this proposal is approved.

Senator Guinta said there is no question that the associate degree program is the bastard child of the College. He explained that he has been working for 12 years on the associate degree programs and that he and others have finally reached the stage where they are truly ready to serve these students and now this proposal comes forward. He said there is no question that standards should be raised and that there is no question that we could be doing more for these students. And, he reported, he and others have developed a proposal for a new associate degree program in criminal justice, a kind of A.S./B.S. program, which would allow students to come into the College at the associate degree level and we would have watched and monitored the students for their first two years and then if the student met the criteria, not the minimal criteria of passing the proficiency tests but those criteria we have established to enter our bachelor's programs, they could enter the baccalaureate program, and that would have been a good thing.

This proposed associate in criminal justice is on the agenda of the February College Council meeting, he pointed out, and said his research for the proposed associate in criminal justice shows there are over 200 agencies, not just in policing, where an associate degree is necessary. In New York City, a police officer applicant needs an associate degree or 60 credits. Around the country, in such states as Florida, he said, an associate degree is required in order to get credentialed.

Senator Guinta agreed that we have a high attrition rate among associate degree students but that does not mean, he said, that we cannot raise the criteria, which will improve the program. For example, if a student comes here and fails all three proficiency tests or does very poorly on those proficiency tests, we could say that this student should attend a community college where these kinds of skills are taught, where there is a mechanism for teaching these skills. We could raise the admissions standards in terms of the high school GPA although we do have students coming in with 90 high school averages who also fail all three proficiency tests. We are **also** failing to recognize that the need for remediation is a national problem.

Senator Guinta recalled that Mayor Giuliani, a few months ago, put forward a proposal that any student 18 or older who is attending a public high school should be thrown out of school. The analysis conducted after he made the proposal showed that 35,000 students would be thrown out: where are these students going to go, he asked. Mayor Giuliani proposes not funding 75% of the community colleges: where are those students going to go, he asked. He said that those of us who lived through the 1960's know about the private programs the Mayor is proposing: people like Fran Tarkington developed those same kinds of institutes and then years later it was discovered that they had bilked millions of dollars and nothing happened. He said he was the original **SEEK**

director in New Jersey and one of the reasons SEEK was put onto the college campuses was so that students could get a college experience. We also know that one reason crime is on the decline is that the population is aging and, therefore, maturing. At John Jay we give students time to mature.

Senator Guinta said the 4% graduation rate sounds bad, and is bad, but we could do things as a faculty that are a more creative than closing the associate program. To close programs because the graduation rate doesn't look good is a lack of integrity, he said. We, as an institution, have gone forward for years and years, trying to do something here, many of us have given years to reach this point and for us to just give up these programs without studying the ramifications is unacceptable. How many faculty would lose their jobs, he asked. We are getting 50 new faculty: would we need those new faculty? We are going to rent space on 57 Street: would we need that space? Would we need a new building? There are questions that have to be studied in terms of the ramifications for the College. He said he thinks this is precipitous. And so he again regrets that the Senate could not have had this discussion before President Kaplowitz spoke in support of ending the associate degree program.

Senator Arlene Geiger said that one part of the budget which is enrollment driven is the adjunct budget. She spoke of the high burden of work borne by adjuncts, especially 100-level courses. Therefore, she proposes that some discretionary funds from grants, for example, be set aside for adjuncts to tutor our students.

Senator Sandra Lanzone said she supports Senator Guinta's comments and said we have worked hard also in trying to get police officers back to John Jay and then the requirement to be a police officer was changed to requiring 60 credits to enter the force but if we close the associate degree program we might be turning lots of students away from this College, especially if the baccalaureate programs have to raise their admissions criteria.

Senator James Malone said he thinks that what is really driving the discussion about the associate degree program is Baruch President Matthew Goldstein's plan for CUNY to be a university with three different tiers. He said he thinks John Jay would end up in Tier II no matter what we do -- whether we have the associate degree program or not. He said we have to be careful what we do because jobs may be at stake, and we are never going to be in Tier I with Queens College, no matter what. He added we would never be in Tier III, which are community colleges. He said that of the four senior colleges that give associate degrees, we are the only one that began as a senior college: the other three began as or were merged with a community college. The tier-plan would enable those senior colleges with overly inflated budgets not based on student generated monies to keep those budgets as is. Those colleges do not want to go to student enrollment driven budgets because their budgets would drastically change when they downsize as a result of their new and higher admissions criteria. If we drop the associate program, we could lose faculty and so we should not rush to judgment. But in the final analysis, we will not move into Tier I with Queens, Hunter, Brooklyn, and Baruch. City is even on the cusp as to whether it would be in Tier I. Tier I would get the best budgets because they will have the better students, the smaller classes, the **"better"** programs. We will be second class citizens. The community colleges, which get a somewhat better budget because of their funding formula, might be better protected than those in Tier II.

Senator Ed Green said he has taught as an adjunct at another campus where math classes of 16 were considered outrageously large and yet he has 39 students in each class here. He said we do not provide the help that our associate students need and, thus, we have built in automatic failure for our associate students. Senator Guinta again said he regrets President Kaplowitz's participation in the P&B discussion.

Senator Ellen Marson, having arrived from the P&B, reported that after President Kaplowitz left the P&B, a non-binding straw vote was taken. The vote was 14 yes, 1 no, and 7 abstentions in support of closing the associate degrees program. Asked whether the vote was by secret ballot, Senator Marson said it was not. And she said that the vote is not binding because first the Curriculum Committee and then ultimately the College Council must vote. She noted that the vote is not official also because many people at the meeting who are not on the P&B Committee voted. And so this is not even a vote from the P&B Committee.

Senator Marson added that Karen had not spoken on behalf of the Senate and that it had been just a preliminary discussion. Senator James Malone said that whenever the person who holds the title of chair speaks in public that person speaks in that capacity and so when Karen speaks, she speaks as President of the Senate. President Kaplowitz agreed with Senator Malone but added that in announcing that she was coming to the Senate it was clear that she had not spoken to the Senate nor could have, not having known the topic of the meeting. She noted there have been many situations when she participated in meetings and has given testimony without having had a chance to meet with the Senate and that if consultation were the condition of speaking at the P&B, then none of the department chairs could speak because they had not been able to consult with their departments. She said she also felt she was providing a perspective she has gained as a member of the University Faculty Senate's Executive Committee and as someone who attends all Board of Trustees meetings and Board committee meetings. She added there was no discussion at the P&B of ending remediation: we would continue to give remediation to all the students who need it. She reported she is on a CUNY-wide ad hoc faculty committee on remediation chaired by Vice Chancellor Mirrer and that the faculty's goal and commitment is to ensure that remediation is provided to our students.

President Kaplowitz said she considered the P&B discussion a very preliminary one, and that she also knew that the P&B is not the body that can make this decision. It is only the College Council that can vote to close degree programs, including associate degree programs, just as it is only the College Council that can vote to create degree programs, and she noted that she had asserted this fact at the P&B meeting before leaving for the Senate meeting. President Lynch had concurred that it is the College Council that has to approve any closing of degree programs and he also told the P&B that he plans to ask the Curriculum Committee to consider his proposal at its February 20 meeting and so the earliest possible scheduled vote by the College Council would be at the March 16 meeting or at a later meeting of the College Council. President Kaplowitz said that the College could follow the example of the other senior colleges, each of which has developed a grid which provides various criteria by which students could be admitted to that college and that she would include this material with the next Senate agenda, when we will undoubtedly continue this discussion.

President Kaplowitz also said that when a person is elected to chair the Senate or any other body, the person is being entrusted to use her or his best judgment and knowledge if unable to consult. She said if her personal opinion was not representative of the Senate or if her judgment or information was flawed, this is the place to convey that and it was for this reason that as soon as she came into the room she asked that the agenda be suspended so that we could have this very discussion. But, she said, to have sat at the meeting and not participated, based on the information she had, especially from her meetings at 80th Street, would have been an abdication of leadership. She said one of the things she said at the P&B is that just as the media do not in general accurately represent CUNY or its students, the Trustees are not accurately represented because they are not a monolithic group of enemies of the students or faculty of CUNY.

Senator John Donaruma said that this is the first he has heard of this issue and he thinks that a decision like this needs to be made with all the facts available and that we should not allow ourselves to be pushed into making decisions we are not ready to make. He said he does not know, frankly, how he would vote, but before voting he wants to know the pro's and con's. Senator Donaruma added he doesn't like this feeling, which we have been presented with in the past, that we have to do something in a rush. He suggested we obtain data about the implications and then have a further discussion. Senator Sandra Lanzzone asked whether when President Lynch meets with Vice Chancellor Mirrer next week he is going to report there had been a vote to close the associate program. Senator Marson said no, that President Lynch had made it clear he is intent on there being many meetings on this issue.

Vice President Dan Pinello said that as an academic he has a lot of sympathy with many of the things said today but as a political scientist he thinks we have to face certain political realities: last November, Mayor Giuliani was overwhelmingly re-elected for another term and the Governor is likely to be reelected next fall because there is no Democratic challenger who will be able to take him on. Even though the Governor has proposed an executive budget for this coming year that is generous, once he is re-elected it will go the other way. Those two officials, the Mayor and the Governor, control, in essence, our employers, the CUNY Board of Trustees, and he would much rather, he said, be in a position to be in some kind of control over the College's destiny rather than in a sense being an academic ostrich with his head in the sand totally blind to the political whirlwinds around him. He said as an academic he agrees that deliberation is critically important but at a public university that is going through the kind of turmoil we are going through that is being forced upon us, he is not sure we have that luxury. Better that we have some control over what is happening at John Jay rather than none and have a decision totally thrust upon us. Therefore, he said, we need to act expeditiously.

President Kaplowitz said she is concerned that if we tell the Board only that we are now first proposing an associate degree that articulates with our baccalaureate programs and do nothing more that will be insufficient. She said that President Lynch's statement that only 4% of our students get their associates degree has to be put into context. She said she happens to have, for another meeting, the associate degree and baccalaureate degree graduation rates of the senior and community colleges.



After 6 years, the associate degree graduation rates at the community colleges of first-time, full-time freshmen are as follows, compared to John Jay 4% rate of graduation:

Borough of Manhattan Community College	22.6%
Bronx Community College	22.9%
Hostos Community College	17.8
Kingsborough Community College	35.1%
LaGuardia Community College	31.8%
Queensborough Community College	24.8%

She said it may be difficult to justify our 4% graduation rate not only compared to the graduation rates of community colleges but also in light of the fact that we are a senior college, with a teaching load of the senior colleges.

She also noted how difficult it is for us to properly serve all our students given our underfunding, which the-Senate-has long worked to improve. A chart developed for an agenda item for today's meeting shows the number of skills and required general education course sections taught by full-time and by adjunct faculty: only 13% of those sections are taught by full-time faculty, and these are the courses freshmen and sophomores take, whether associate or baccalaureate students. We have an obligation, she said, to the students we accept, whether associate or baccalaureate, to provide them with the educational and support services they need and deserve. The more associate degree students we have, the more services we need to provide.

Senator Donaruma asked what our associate degree graduation rate would be if we included those who technically earned the degree but did not sign up to get the degree. President Kaplowitz said that is a very good question, the answer of which she does not know and that we should find out the answer, but, she added, the point of the information about students who did not respond to the offer of the degree seemed to be that students in rejecting that option were expressing their lack of interest in and lack of use for the associate degrees we offer.

Senator Carmen Solis said we need to discuss our associate programs in an informed way, based on data and information, and not be pressured to make any decision in a hurry. Our associate program offers other opportunities not measured by the graduation rates: students who receive AFDC (students on welfare) are faced with new workfare regulations which means many students who enter under the associate category are not remedial students and can qualify for our baccalaureate program but are forced by welfare regulations to be associate degree students. Many are admitted to the baccalaureate program and then transfer into the associate program because welfare recipients are not permitted to be in baccalaureate programs. We would be cutting off those students.

Senator Agnes Wieschenberg said this is a major decision because we either want to be a senior college or be dragged into the community college level. She said she is in favor of raising admissions standards because she wants to ensure that John Jay remains a senior college and not be forced to become a community college. With regard to adjuncts' positions, she said the risk of keeping the associate program could be that our teaching load could be increased which would mean, in turn, a loss of adjunct positions. She also suggested that with the senior college designation we might have smaller classes and thus be more successful with our students. She said she is not a political

person but as someone who has been reading the newspaper she knows that the major trend is to raise standards at CUNY. If we want to go against the trend, we will pay for it at the end, she said. She said she is certain that even with higher admission standards we would be able to attract students to our College. Students who want our programs and cannot meet our admission criteria would be able to attend a community college and then transfer to John Jay. She said our College is so overcrowded we could fill three new buildings with 20% fewer students than we have today. She said she supports the proposal because everyone would benefit.

Senator Barry Luby said he agrees with Senator Wieschenberg. He said we should raise standards for academic reasons, not for political reasons. He said we can not continue lowering standards as we have been doing for the last six or seven years. Those opposing the raising of admission standards would have to prove to him that we would lose faculty if we did do so. He said he does not think we would. He asked whether we really are teaching on the senior college level or whether we are not, in fact, teaching on the junior college level. He said we are already losing creative, excellent faculty who are choosing to retire because they cannot cope with the classroom problems.

Senator Ellen Marson said some administrators at the P&B meeting raised reasons as to why, perhaps, we should not close the associate program. She added that President Lynch was asked whether we would lose full-time faculty if we close the program and whether we would lose whatever progress we have made toward obtaining the new building and he was adamant on both issues, that not one full-time faculty member would go and that the new building was already set and that Baruch had lost enrollment and they, nonetheless, have a new building that is being constructed.

Senator Ed Green asked whether at the P&B meeting the loss of adjunct faculty was mentioned or only the **loss** of full-time faculty. Senator Marson answered that only full-time lines were spoken about. She asked President Kaplowitz to report what Mr. Gray and Dean Marousek had said. It was reported that Donald Gray said we would lose 800 freshmen the first year but that the flip side is that we would draw more baccalaureate students. Dean of Admissions Frank Marousek said our freshman class decreased by 2% but our transfer students increased by 12% and he said he does not think we would lose students in the long run (though probably we would in the short term) if we cut off this avenue of entrance as long as we engage in a well-planned recruitment campaign.

What is very important to factor in, President Kaplowitz said, is that by action of the CUNY Board of Trustees in October, no associate program student are henceforth permitted to transfer into any baccalaureate program, even within the same college, unless the student passes all three proficiency exams and, when implemented, the proficiency exam required to move beyond 60 credits, and so we could have a tremendous drop in our baccalaureate enrollment unless we change our admissions policies. and recruit and advertise, as the Senate has long recommended.

President Kaplowitz said Dean of Admissions Frank Marousek spoke very strongly in favor of closing associate program. Asked whether we would receive better prepared students who do not meet the newly raised admission criteria of the seven senior colleges, he said no because students will transfer into their first choice college as soon as they do meet the new admissions requirements. He also said that 98% of students who come to John Jay choose John

Jay as their first choice: they check our baccalaureate program as their first choice and the associate program as their second choice and so he thinks that if they don't get into their first choice they go to the college they can get accepted into and then transfer into their first choice college as soon as they qualify for admissions there. And so if students who want to attend John Jay have to attend a community college, they will eventually transfer here just as those who want to go to Hunter, for example, will transfer to Hunter when they can.

President Kaplowitz reported that Provost Basil Wilson is very concerned about access for students as were others at the P&B and he pointed out that although the associate degree students may not be earning associate degrees, many are earning baccalaureate degrees and that, in fact, 14% of our associate degree students earn a baccalaureate degree after 8 years. He did note that, on the other hand, triple remedial students (those who fail all three of the freshman placement exams -- in reading, writing, and mathematics) have only a 1% graduation rate.

Senator Kwando Kinshasa said he always thought that in our society a major purpose of education is jobs. But he is also aware of the unholy alliance between public schools Chancellor Rudy Crew and Mayor Giuliani in terms of the Mayor's criticism of CUNY while not really dealing with what happens during K-12. He said that he agrees with Assemblyman Ed Sullivan who says, in a document sent to the Senate members, that CUNY's standards are high but the standards in K-12 need to be looked at. Our associate degree program dilemma may be a blessing in disguise because if we decide to hold onto our associate program and tighten up on our admission criteria we will be in a better position than before. Furthermore, the graduation rates of the community colleges may not reflect students' ability to pass the proficiency tests. John Jay serves police officers, firefighters, and other working people and so we have to make our associate degree programs the premier programs in a senior college. If the Board adopts the Matthew Goldstein tier proposal it will show a lack of integrity, or political conservatism, or classism, or racism. One must realize that over 50% of the K-12 students are Spanish-speaking and black and, he said, he is very concerned that they have access to a university system but he is concerned that the conservative agenda issue is raising standards. It is not a question of standards but rather of conservative ideology played out within the educational structure.

Senator Glenn Corbett said the Public Management Department is currently developing a new associate degree program in Fire Science. A new program was just set up at Randall's Island for firefighters: the program does not cost John Jay anything but on the contrary brings revenue to the College. Our College's service mission includes firefighters. He said he thinks if we drop the associate program altogether we will lose these students and we will push the firefighters to SUNY/Empire State and to distance learning at other colleges. President Kaplowitz noted that the firefighters do not seem to want the degree but rather the 60 credits they need for promotion: could we not offer the baccalaureate program in Fire Science, at least 60 credits worth, at Randall's Island. Senator Corbett agreed we could do that but it would mean one less option for the firefighters.

Senator P. J. Gibson asked whether there had been telephone calls and other followups to students who were sent a letter telling them they had qualified for an associate degree. She also

asked what can be done for the June 1998 graduates to make certain that they do sign the forms to obtain their associate degree. Phone calls can be made to these students, she said, and we can increase our graduation numbers. With respect to recruiting better prepared students if we close the associate program, she said we should be recruiting now and should have been recruiting, as the Senate has urged, and that we can do so without closing the associate program. We need to go out and do what the other colleges do: recruit better prepared students.

Senator Lanzone said we are the criminal justice college and we should have the associate degrees in criminal justice here. The Mayor says no remediation and so we run scared. As others have said, our existing associate degree programs are not realistic but we have two being proposed that are realistic. Why would a student who has 96 credits bother filling out a form to get an associate degree when the student expects to get the BA the following year. She said we should work to improve our associate degree programs and that we are victimizing our students if we close the associate program. The Heather MacDonald article in the January issue of "City Journal" called "CUNY Could Be Great Again," which was included with the agenda material for today's meeting, calls on ending open admissions and then closing African-American Studies, Gender Studies, and everything else we worked for 25 years to have in our colleges. That is the Republican Conservative agenda.

Vice President Pinello said "**political**" is not necessarily a dirty word: it means government making policy choices. The courses offered, the number of students in an institution, are all policy choices. At a public university these choices will be made in a political process, whether we like that reality or not. We can not wish that reality away.

Senator Kojo Dei asked Vice President Pinello about the ideology behind the politics. He said most of us believe in the ideology of the 1960s and asked what we can do. Vice President Pinello said that the game isn't played at this level, it is played at the level of organizing voters, including students, so that people who would make these kinds of policy choices are not elected to office. He said it is too late because the Mayor has been re-elected and the Governor will be. President Kaplowitz said it is also too late because the Trustees have been appointed by this Mayor and Governor and, in fact, two more seats will be filled by them, one next year, a mayoral appointment, and another the following year, a gubernatorial appointment. And so in two years the entire Board will be Giuliani and Pataki appointees.

Senator Kinshasa asked whether this means the structure is already in place in terms of our not being able to successfully fight for the associate program. President Kaplowitz said no.

Senator Geiger reported that in a poll taken on Manhattan's Upper West Side, 60 percent said Open Admissions at CUNY should be ended. It was noted that is the most liberal section of the City.

President Kaplowitz said she believes in access and opportunity and that she chose to teach here rather than at private colleges and that we are not talking about ending remediation. Many of our baccalaureate students need remediation: 25%, in fact. Students at all the senior colleges need remediation. She said we are talking about closing programs that do not seem to be generating degrees. She said she fears that if we go to 80th Street and to the Trustees with a proposal for a new

associate degree in fire science and a new associate degree in criminal justice at a time when this Board is scrutinizing the colleges and we say we want to add to our associate degree programs even though we have a **4%** graduation rate and the reason we give is that our associate degrees do not articulate with our baccalaureate degrees even though articulation has been CUNY Board policy since the 1970s, our College will not be well thought of.

Senator Guinta said the strategy is simple: we should go to 80th Street with a proposal to close the associate in corrections and in security and create a new associate in criminal justice because it better articulates with our bachelor's programs.

Senator Marson said the entire discussion has been about whether to retain or close the associate programs but we haven't talked about admissions criteria: why not close the programs but make entrance into the baccalaureate programs easier. Senator Guinta said he would reverse that: we should raise admissions standards. He said he is for keeping associate programs not because he is for remediation but because there are students who need our associate degree. Our programs have not articulated and we have never pushed students to complete their associate degree, he said. The two programs that are not giving any degrees, corrections and security, could be closed at our initiative.

President Kaplowitz said that earlier Senator James Malone spoke about President Matt Goldstein's three-tier proposal. She said rumors have been circulating about a 4-tier system which would consist of Baruch, Brooklyn, Hunter, Queens in Tier I; City, Lehman, York in Tier II; the senior colleges with associate degree programs (John Jay, Medgar Evers, NYC Tech, College of Staten Island) in Tier III; the community colleges in Tier IV.

She said whether it is the proposal to close our associate degree programs or another proposal, we should be able to report we are addressing the issues raised by the Trustees. She said that in addition to the graduation rates of the community colleges compared to our associate's degree graduation rate of 4% (see page 9), our baccalaureate graduation rates compared to those of the other senior colleges are instructive:

After 8 years, the baccalaureate graduation rates of first-time, full-time freshmen are as follows:

Baruch **49%**  
Brooklyn **42%**  
CCNY 35%  
Hunter 34%  
Lehman **33%**  
Queens 45%  
York 29%  
John Jay 23.5%

After **8** years, the baccalaureate graduation rates of the four senior colleges with associate degree programs are as follows:

Staten Island 34%  
NYC Tech **28%**  
John Jay 23.5%  
Medgar Evers 21%.

Senator Guinta said he does think we should raise our admission requirements. He said he does not think the associate

degree program should be a backdoor for students to come into John Jay. We can raise our standards because of the requirement of 60 credits to go into the police department. We are a special mission college. He said he is not adverse to standards and he believes we can raise admission requirements and still have a very viable associate degree program.

Vice President Pinello said he has been at John Jay for three years during which time we have talked about raising standards and to his knowledge the College has gone in the opposite direction. He said during his first year he participated in an outreach program to recruit students at precincts and at high schools and the program died within a year. Senator Guinta agreed.

In response to a question as to what our baccalaureate admission requirements are, Senator Marson said they had been distributed at the P&B and she read them:

"An applicant for admission to the College must present a diploma from an accredited high school (a high school certificate is not an acceptable substitute), a High School Equivalency Diploma (evidence of having passed the General Education examination), or a New York State Equivalency Diploma. Entering Freshmen with high school averages higher than 75 or combined SAT scores of 900/1020R [the rescored grade] or rank above the fiftieth (50) percentile of their graduating class or who have GED scores of 270 or higher may be eligible for admission to a baccalaureate degree program. Students with a high school average lower than 75 or GED scores below 270 should select one of the associate degree programs in order to be assigned to the College by the University Applications Processing Center. Entering transfer students must have achieved a minimum cumulative grade point average of at least 2.0 from all colleges attended in order to be admitted to a baccalaureate or associate degree program."

Senator Guinta said we do have to set higher admissions standards to our programs. President Kaplowitz suggested that whatever we decide, we should continue to provide access to in-service students. Senator Lanzone said if we raise standards we should do so for every student, without exception, and not give special consideration to in-service students. President Kaplowitz said we are a special mission college, with the mandate to provide education for in-service students as well as pre-service students.

Senator Lanzone said that the Faculty Senate's discussion should be reported to President Lynch before he meets with Vice Chancellor Mirrer. President Kaplowitz assured the Senate that she would do so and that she would report that at this preliminary discussion there was strong opposition voiced as well as many questions and requests for data with regard to the proposal, in addition to the fact that there was some support voiced.

By a motion made and adopted, the meeting adjourned at 5 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Edward Davenport

Recording Secretary